CULTURAL

PLANNING FOR

LOCAL

AUTHORITIES

FEBRUARY 2016

İKSV

CULTURAL PLANNING FOR LOCAL AUTHORITIES

FEBRUARY 2016

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

What is culture? Why is it important?

According to UNESCO, "In its widest sense, culture may now be said to be the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only the arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs."

In today's globalizing world, culture is regarded as the fourth leg of sustainable development, along with the economic, social and environmental dimensions.

Culture, which acts as a mediator for the improvement of the dynamics of living together in cities positions itself at the center of development strategies with the social and economic value it creates while contributing to the enhancement of welfare and quality of life.

What role do local authorities play in the making of cultural policies?

In today's cities, where many cultures are intertwined, local authorities stand out as actors that can play an active part in establishing dialogue between citizens, non-governmental organizations, central government and international networks.

Local authorities, which have the ability to have direct contact with citizens and to have command over the socio-cultural characteristics of the region they govern, are expected to make all-embracing policies that adopt a people-oriented and egalitarian understanding of sustainable development.

What is cultural planning?

Cultural planning refers to the inclusion of culture in public planning processes in a strategic and integrated manner. The process of planning begins with determining, using participatory methods and collaborations, the cultural resources that belong to the community that dwell in the region where planning will take place.

Once this is done, the cultural framework is defined and a strategy for an action plan is developed. Finally, a cultural plan is created.

What are the aims and scope of this study?

This study sets out with the idea that, in order to establish sustainable development, planning for neighborhoods, quarters, boroughs and cities should be made in harmony with their cultural resources and that cities where different cultures can co-exist should be created.

This study, which focuses on the practices that a number of different local authorities around the world adopted in order to create sustainable cities, aims to present a roadmap for the local authorities in Turkey, which will allow them to develop a culture-oriented understanding of planning.

The "Introduction" section of the study summarized the basic findings that resulted from the comparison of the municipalities of Istanbul. Section 1 on "Culture and Planning," briefly explains the notion of cultural planning in Turkey and the function of culture in public planning. The stages introduced in Section 2 of this report, which is entitled "Action Plan," aims to accompany the strategic planning processes of local authorities. The section called "Annexes" contains the relevant legal legislation as well comparative charts of the strategic plans of Istanbul's municipalities.

The cultural planning framework set out in this study serves both the global city of Istanbul and other smaller-scale cities and boroughs while highlighting the fact that each should be considered individually in the relevant context.

This approach aims to assist local authorities with their strategic planning and implementation processes, which should be designed in active communication and collaboration with the actors and organizations of the city in a participative and data-oriented manner.

How do other world cities carry out their cultural planning processes?

The results of the survey, which was carried out within the framework of the study in six cities (Amsterdam, New York, Seoul,

Tokyo, Toronto and Vienna) in three different continents show that all of these cities adopt culture as an important part of their strategic planning and highlight a characteristic that is a part of the strong relationship between culture and the city.

For example, Seoul and New York attribute the utmost importance to carrying out the planning process through participative methods, while Vienna emphasizes the need to let cultural actors guide the cultural dynamics of the city. Amsterdam attributes importance to the strengthening of the part culture plays throughout the city and not only in the city center. Tokyo touches on the function of culture in enabling urban development whereas Toronto aims to develop its cultural economy through creative capital.

What is the next research step?

This study does not present an exhaustive analysis of the existing cultural infrastructure of and activities carried out by the municipalities of Istanbul due to the difficulty of accessing reliable, high-quality data regarding cultural indicators.

The study reveals that the following areas should benefit from further research and information gathering: new cultural production and consumption types (digital consumption, etc.) citizens' access and participation in culture; the role artists and other creative professionals play in the social and economic texture of the city.

What is the long-term goal of this study?

The adoption of cultural planning by local authorities in Turkey should make it possible to enhance the participation of citizens in decision-making mechanisms; to create urban awareness and to act as an agent for active communication with city-dwellers.

It is expected that productive collaboration will be established and that the culture policy localization processes will improve when national and international networks bring cities together under the heading of "culture."

SCOPE AND METHOD

Within the scope of this study, Turkey's cultural planning and culture policy literature was reviewed. Examples of the content of the reviewed literature include documents such as *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı* (Local Cultural Policies Handbook: Steps, Tools and Case Studies) published in 2011 by Istanbul Bilgi University, fundamental culture policy documents such as UNESCO reports, Local Agenda 21 for Culture and Agenda 21: Actions. Cultural planning documents of a number of different cities around the world were also reviewed.

Simultaneously with the literature review and in collaboration with BOP Consulting, who coordinated the World Cities Culture Forum[1] communication network, a survey was conducted with local authorities in Amsterdam, New York, Seoul, Tokyo, Toronto and Vienna. The selection of cities was made based on them being global cities and being located in different parts of the world. The questions were designed with the aim of studying the approach of these cities to the concept of cultural planning, their planning processes and the challenges they meet during those processes.

At the same time, contact was made with Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality and the municipalities of Beyoğlu, Şişli, Üsküdar, Kadıköy, Fatih and Beşiktaş, which were chosen due to the large number of cultural and arts events that take place in these boroughs and their intensified culture industry and cultural heritage. A comparison of the strategic plans of these seven municipalities was made under the following headings:

The meaning and role that is attributed to the mission and vision statements of the strategic plan,

Strategic goal and indicator examples in the context of the relationship between culture and city,

Municipal directorates relevant to the relationship between culture and city,

The manner in which cultural diversity, gender, ethnic diversity and freedom of religion are embraced.

Consequently, the existing strategic plans of the selected local authorities in Istanbul; research about cultural planning and the general findings of the study of the experiences of the international municipalities are presented in the "Introduction" section of this report, while the comparative data pertaining to these findings are available in the "Annexes" section.

INTRODUCTION

Culture,[2] which gained an important function in the development of countries with the process of globalization, started to take an important part in public policies. In this context, the connection between the economic success of cities and a lively cultural scene became more apparent. The part that culture plays in improving the dynamics of living together and enhancing welfare became increasingly more visible.

Although local authorities have such a potential, their room for maneuver in Turkey is relatively restricted. Even though the Public Administration Reform has been put into effect, which is believed to have introduced a new dimension to decentralization, it is still being discussed that full decentralization has not yet taken place in practice in terms of resource allocation and power delegation.[3]

Despite that problem, local authorities stand out as actors that can play an active part in establishing dialogue between citizens, non-governmental organizations, central government and international networks. Local authorities assume a significant role in incorporating multicultural infrastructures into the decision-making mechanisms in the best way possible and in establishing a culture of living together, despite differences in today's cities where many cultures intertwine. Local authorities, which have the ability to have direct contact with citizens and to have command over the socio-cultural characteristics of the region they govern, are expected to make all-embracing policies that adopt a people-oriented and egalitarian understanding of sustainable development.

2 "In its widest sense, culture may now be said to be the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only the arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs," *UNESCO, Mexico City Declaration on Cultural Policies World Conference on Cultural Policies, Mexico City. 26 July - 6 August.* p.1. Date of access: 4 January 2016. http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/files/12762/11295421661mexico_en.pdf/mexico_en.pdf
3 İnce, A. (2009). Yerel Düzlemdeki Kamu İdareleri ve Kültür Politikaları in *Türkiye'de Kültür Politikalarına Giriş.* Ada, S., A., İnce. (Eds.).

The processes of planning need to take into account a variety of dynamics in today's globalizing cities, which are getting increasingly more complex. These include the lifestyles of city-dwellers; the relationship they have with their surroundings; the impact on their daily lives of the values, beliefs and habits that come from their past; the history and symbolic properties of the urban environment and their place in social memory.

Another strong aspect of the relationship between culture and the city is the role of culture as a source of employment and economic stimulation through the direct boost it offers creative industries, which have a wide scope covering crafts to design, advertising to the TV business – especially in cities, which today are defined as "new countries."[4] They serve as a catalyst for increased women's employment,[5] and are seen as more resilient industries in the face of economic volatility,[6] thus useful in countering youth unemployment.

Within this context the visibility of Istanbul, as a large metropolitan city, has been increasing in the international arena as a hub for creative industries. From Turkey's point of view, approximately half of the creative industry's workforce is employed in Istanbul.[7] This potential that Istanbul has shows that the cultural economy sits at the heart of development strategies with the social and economic values it creates.[8] Local authorities, as principal actors in creating urban policy and identity, can help to accelerate sustainable development by making use of the potential that culture has through implementing appropriate planning processes.

4 Dervişoğlu Okandan, G. (2016). The Effect of Cultural and Creative Industries on Economic Development of the Cities: A Comparative Analysis of Turkey and UAE. p.1.
5 United Nations Industrial Development Organization. Women in Creative Industries. *UnidoGender*. No:4. Date of Access: 21 January 2016. http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media_upgrade/What_we_do/Topics/Women_and_Youth/UNIDO_Gender_Newsletter_NO.4_A4.pdf
6 Gabe T, Florida R, Mellander C. (2013). The Creative Class and The Crisis. *Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy, and Society*. 6, p.37-53.
7 YEKON (2014). *İstanbul Yaratıcı Ekonomi Çalışmaları Atölyesi Final Raporu*. p.13.
8 Dervişoğlu Okandan, G. (2016). The Effect of Cultural and Creative Industries on Economic Development of the Cities: A Comparative Analysis of Turkey and UAE. p. 3.

This study sets out with the idea that, in order to establish sustainable development, planning for neighborhoods, quarters, boroughs and cities should be made in harmony with their cultural resources and that cities where different cultures can coexist should be created. It aims to point to the initial steps that may be taken to place cultural resources at the center of the planning efforts of local authorities and to design a culture-driven sustainable development approach.

The following findings were drawn from the research as a result of the meetings held with the municipalities of Istanbul and the review of the strategic plans, for which a comparative breakdown has been made available at the end of the report:

The notion of cultural planning has not been sufficiently established in Turkey. Local authorities allow limited space for culture in their strategic plans.

Strategic plans do not adopt an integrated approach that embraces culture, a key element of sustainable development, simultaneously with social, economic and environmental factors. Culture-related targets are generally restricted to the planning of arts events.

Quantitative policies, in general, cause cultural services to be assessed using statistical data such as number of activities, participants and venues. In connection with this, developing the right indicators becomes impossible.

Full localization of cultural policies has not taken place yet. This leads to the lack of clarity regarding the distribution of power and responsibility between borough and metropolitan municipalities and between municipalities and other local public bodies. This results in a failure to make effective use of resources in culture planning.

The mayor plays a key role in creating a cultural vision and implementing projects

In terms of cultural planning, the level of coordination and collaboration between different departments within municipalities is not sufficient.

There is a tendency to focus on either the cultural elements that have heritage value or the contemporary interpretation of those elements in order to carry such heritage into the future, rather than adopting an approach whereby the two are blended to contribute to social development.

Planning does not involve issues such as multiculturalism, migration, ethnic diversity and religious belief, which play an important role in establishing social justice and peace; or these issues are overlooked in practice.

The lack of a system that would allow national cultural information gathering poses an obstacle to the development of a culture-driven understanding of planning.

The method of strategic plan preparation that is commonly used by the municipalities is more appropriate for use by central administrations.

1 | CULTURE AND PLANNING

Culture and the city are two inseparable concepts. Culture, which takes its source from society and which is returned to society through cultural services, needs financial support as well as being included in planning processes so as to ensure that it is accessible by every citizen. With its ability to make these services accessible to the masses, the public sector has a key function in ensuring that the cultural area, cultural endeavors and local production is supported; city-dwellers are encouraged to take part in cultural life through various cultural venues and events; disadvantaged communities have facilitated access to culture and participation in cultural production; urban identity is enriched; tangible and intangible cultural heritage is preserved; areas of artisanship and design are supported; and that independent artistic groups and artists are supported through the provision of culture centers and similar venues and the local implementation of the projects of culture professionals and cultural capacity building projects. Only those cities that have integrated culture into their planning and service processes with all the above-mentioned dimensions will attain sustainable development.

The role of culture in public planning can also be described as follows:[9]

Is an important resource in public processes such as policy-making, planning, implementation and review as it embraces shared values, ways of expression and encompasses all practices.

Plays a key role in ensuring sustainability and welfare.

Allows for studying the past, taking action today and talking about the future.

---

[9] Hawkes, J. (2001). *The Fouth Pillar of Sustainability: Culture's Essential Role in Public Planning* p. 1, 2.

Is all-encompassing in that it brings together a large number of concepts that public planning takes into consideration such as welfare, harmony, capacity building, participation, ownership and openness.

Introduces an accessible, flexible and standardizable framework that holds all social relations and the styles of organization that shape those relations.

A cultural perspective provides the necessary participatory dimension for public policies that place emphasis on the participation of communities in the decision-making processes and on making their voices heard.

Consequently, the values to which culture will contribute in public planning may be listed as follows:[10]

Participation, engagement and democracy,

Tolerance, compassion and inclusion,

Freedom, justice and equality,

Peace, safety and security,

Creativity, imagination and innovation,

Health, wellbeing and vitality,

Love and respect for the environment.

---

10 ibid. p. 7.

1 | A | CULTURE TERMINOLOGY

The practice of cultural planning is an ever-developing one, which brings about new concepts. The lexicon of the field is enriched with every passing day. The definitions provided herein aim to ensure that the terminology used throughout the study is comprehensible.

Cultural vitality: Cultural vitality, which underlies the creation of a sustainable and healthy society, refers to the existence, recognition and support of opportunities that will ensure public welfare and increase the quality of life.

Cultural framework: This refers to the vision, policies, strategies and indicators that provide the bases for the inclusion of the cultural dimension in public planning. A cultural framework provides a backdrop to the planning strategy adopted for the enhancement of urban cultural vitality.

Cultural diversity: Refers to the product of thousands of years of history that came into being through the languages, ideas, creations and activities of all communities. Cultural diversity is a multidimensional concept and it allows individuals from different cultures and beliefs and with different languages to live together in society as well as ensuring that their identities and differences are continually redefined. As such, cultural diversity is the building block of a peaceful society and of the notion of citizenship that takes its form within that society.

Cultural indicator: The 2005 *Statistical Indicators for Arts Policy* report drafted by the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies (IFACCA) defines a cultural indicator as "a statistic that can be used to make sense of, or monitor, or evaluate some aspect of culture such as the arts, or cultural policies, or programs and activities."[11]

---

[11] IFACCA. *Statistical Indicators for Arts Policy.* http://media.ifacca.org/files/statisticalindicatorsforartspolicy.pdf

Cultural mapping: Refers to the gathering of data using a number of research techniques and to the combining and analyzing of existing databases to identify and visually represent the cultural resources of the community living in the regions where planning is made.

Cultural resources: Cultural resources, which consist of data on human, economic and cultural infrastructures, define abstract means of expression such as the lifestyles, cultural habits and beliefs that prevail in a society as well as the cultural spaces that carry a meaning for that society. (See Chart 4: Getting to Know Our City, p. 43)[12]

Cultural heritage: Cultural heritage plays a major part in the formation of social identity with its wide scope that encompasses anything from the memories of the city to the natural environment as well as the tangible and intangible cultural heritage of the city. It is an ever-evolving concept that belongs to both the past and the present day, which makes it an active part of social life.

Cultural plan: Refers to the drawing up of an action plan and a budget in view of the cultural framework that has been established.

Cultural planning: Refers to the inclusion of culture in public planning processes in a strategic and integrated manner. The process of planning begins with determining the cultural resources that belong to the community that dwell in the region where planning will take place, using participatory methods and collaboration. Once this is done, the cultural framework is defined and a strategy for an action plan is developed. Finally, a cultural plan is created.

---

[12] Ertürk, E. (2011). *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı*. p. 53.

Intercultural cities: This is a project that is run by the Council of Europe. The project advocates for the need for integrated regulations to facilitate different cultures living together and aims to create cities that foster intercultural dialogue and coexistence.

Creative economy:[13] Creative assets potentially generating economic growth and development.

Creative industries:[14] Economic activities at the cross-section of arts, business and technology heavily depending on creativity and subject to intellectual property.

Creative city:[15] An urban complex where cultural activities of various sorts are an integral component of the city's economic and social functioning.

Local cultural policies: Refer to the cultural and arts activities policies of local authorities. In addition to ensuring cultural diversity and increasing participation in culture, these policies also aim to make sure that the artistic and cultural means of expression of all of the residents in a region or city are secured by public policies. Another aim is to attain sustainable social, economic and environmental development for the city.

13 Dervişoğlu Okandan, G. The Effect of Cultural and Creative Industries on Economic Development of the Cities: A Comparative Analysis of Turkey and UAE. p.18.
14 ibid.
15 ibid.

1 | B | DIFFERENT TYPES OF CULTURAL PLANNING

Global cities are increasingly using the cultural planning method following the realization that it plays an important role in creating sustainable cities.

Cultural planning refers to the strategic and integrated use of the city's cultural resources during the process of its development; in other words, it refers to viewing urban planning through a cultural perspective. However, unlike the traditional processes of urban planning, cultural planning allows for the designing of wide-scope projects. (See Chart 1. Different Types of Cultural Planning, p. 22) Focusing on a neighborhood that has priority; addressing a specific cultural area or conducting cultural mapping studies are all examples of cultural planning.

Cultural planning and arts events planning often get confused. Arts events planning refers to the setting up of the programs of theaters, galleries, concert halls and arts centers; the determining of which independent artists, culture and arts institutions and educational projects are to be supported and the preparation of annual plans to ensure the participation of city-dwellers in these events. In other words, arts events planning is a subheading in cultural planning. On the other hand, cultural planning adopts a culture-oriented and integrated planning approach that takes into account components such as urban design, public art, transportation and security. [16]

The scope and characteristics of strategic planning vary according to the size of a particular city or borough. The following chart presents a summary of examples of different types of cultural planning in light of this information.[17]

---

[16] Evans, G. (2001). *Cultural Planning*. p.7.
[17] Adapted from the *Cultural Planning Toolkit* (2010) prepared by the Creative City Network of Canada.

Chart 1. Different Types of Cultural Planning

Cultural resources mapping
The cultural resources of the city are identified through comprehensive and collaborative research processes. Cultural mapping, which can also be carried out as a type of sub-planning, is the most critical phase of any cultural planning process.

Specific area cultural plan
Annual planning of targets and events focusing on a single area. It is, for example, possible to place a particular area of arts in the center of planning. This type of planning includes drafting programs for the arts institutions in the city that receive public support; identifying the independent artists, culture and arts institutions and educational projects to be supported and creating annual plans to ensure the participation of city-dwellers in these events.

Specific borough cultural plan
Focuses on a specific neighborhood or city center. It aims to ensure that cultural resources are used effectively in planning for the urban area to be improved.

Assessment of the local dynamics and context of a specific area of arts or culture
Some examples include undertaking research on culture tourism potential; conducting a feasibility study for a cultural center; studying the economic impact of culture industries on a borough or city.

Cultural planning focused on issues of participation to cultural life
Planning approach that focuses on matters such as access or diversity in communities that live in the planning area.

Cultural component of a municipal or regional general plan
Culture is integrated as one part of a municipal strategic plan. The key point in this type of planning is to ensure that all other relevant units within the municipality consider culture as a source to help achieve their goals.

Comprehensive cultural plan
Cultural needs of the communities that will work in collaboration to implement the plan and the cultural infrastructure of the area subject to planning are compiled through research and study. Cultural resources are then integrated into urban planning in accordance with the results of that study.

1 | **C** | **KEY COMPONENTS OF SUCCESFUL CULTURAL PLANNING**

Cultural planning is a dynamic process. Some of the different types of planning that are shown in Chart 1 can also make up some of the subcomponents of a wider-scope cultural plan. Starting by focusing on a subcomponent of cultural planning in consideration of the administrative facilities of the local authority, the presence of cultural resources and the budget to be allocated and moving towards a wider-scope cultural planning goal is another possibility. However, it should be kept in mind that comprehensive cultural planning requires the process to be carried out using a strategic, integrated and participatory approach.[18]

Strategic: The most important component of strategic planning is to set long-term goals that go beyond daily targets. Cultural planning is a part of wider-scope strategies such as urban planning and social development. It requires having a vision that goes beyond organizing arts events, which at first sight it may mistakenly be interpreted as being. The relationship with technical works and infrastructure services; economic development goals; social justice; planning leisure activities; housing development projects and public services planning should be taken into consideration and included as part of the scope.

With this in mind, local authorities should work in communication and cooperation with other actors in their region or city who are responsible for planning when determining its own goals and priorities. Regional plans published by development agencies are also strategic resources. Adopting such a comprehensive vision will help to achieve long-term goals.

---

18 Mercer, C. (2006). *Cultural Planning for Urban Development and Creative Cities*. p. 6.

Question 1. Is cultural planning a part of the strategic planning of the local authority?	
Amsterdam	Yes. It is becoming that more and more. Now that the Arts and Culture department is part of a cluster with Economic Affairs and Urban Planning, we are more included in strategic planning.[19]
New York[20]	Yes. Pursuant to legislation passed by the New York City Council and signed into law by Mayor Bill de Blasio in May of 2015, New York City will begin the process of preparing its first cultural plan in summer of 2016.
Seoul[21]	Yes. In December 2013, Seoul's urban master plan called "2030 Seoul Plan" was announced under the National Land Planning and Utilization Act. Among the five key areas of the 2030 Seoul Plan, culture is addressed in the areas of history, culture and environment, but it is mainly on the agenda for the city's overall plan for the land use, in which the plan provides a long-term direction for urban development.
Tokyo	Yes.
Toronto	Yes. Toronto has been reasonably successful embedding culture into the city's overall strategic plan. That has resulted in opportunities to participate across divisions.
Vienna	No, only in special aspects. For example if a museum has to be restored or relocated in other areas, we define the area according to the needs of the surrounding population [...]. We encourage the cultural expression of the citizens more than giving them a plan. In general we have a big focus on festival policy in all cultural fields (music, theatre, film, street art, open air performances.) We subsidize many cultural associations of other cultures living in Vienna.

19 The following website contains the relevant heading but the content is available only in Dutch. http://www.amsterdameconomicboard.com/english
20 DCLA website is available at http://www.nyc.gov/html/dcla/html/home/home.shtml
21 The answers provided for Seoul have been gathered together using statements made by the following individuals who took part in the preparation of 2030 plan: Dr. Na, Do-Sam (Senior Research Fellow, The, Seoul Institute), Mr. Kim, Hae-Bo (Head of the R&D Team, Seoul Foundation for Arts and Culture, Mr. Kim, Hoon-Gi (Senior Administrator, Cultural Policy Team, Headquarter of Culture, Seoul Metropolitan Government).

Integral: Cultural planning should observe not only the cultural infrastructure and superstructure and structured environmental characteristics and indicators such as tangible cultural heritage but also all other characteristics such as all of the lifestyles prevailing in the city, daily life and habits and intangible cultural heritage, which may be less visible but which nevertheless carry existential meaning for societies and sub-communities. Therefore, culture planning professionals should be made a part of housing, trade center and urban transformation projects from the start, to ensure that these projects are designed in harmony with cultural planning. Those professionals must also make sure that public and private sector officials take into consideration the lifestyles and cultural practices of the residents of the planning areas. For this reason, cultural planning is a process that must be an integral part of all urban planning processes rather than being made a part of them only at a later phase.

Participatory: Adopting participatory principles during cultural planning will ensure that the cultural needs and values of city-dwellers will be reflected onto the process of planning; that a stronger relationship with city-dwellers will be established and that different perspectives will be taken into consideration by the individuals who are responsible for planning. Using efficient methods to implement participatory processes is a prerequisite for the plan reaching its goals.[22]

Information about some participatory methods has been provided in later sections of this report, where the practical dimensions of the process are covered (See "Using participatory methods" under Research and Information Gathering, p. 45).

---

[22] Active participation of citizens in urban decision-making processes may also be read in the context of "urban rights." See Kutlu-Tonak, Z. (2016). Participation and the Right to the City: The Case of Turkey. *ODTÜ Gelişme Dergisi.* January 2016. p.457 – 480 for a detailed discussion of this right specifically in Turkey

Having a strategic, integrated and participatory plan will help that plan to be built on a strong foundation. The following list contains recommendations for successful cultural planning:[23]

Take time to do the necessary pre-planning,

Use cultural mapping,

Use participatory processes to recruit participants who are representative of individuals living in the planning area and to engage them in the decision-making processes,

Identify cultural resources,

Inform the makers and the target audience of the plan accurately about the concrete effects and benefits of culture on development,

Integrate cultural planning into the local authority general planning process,

Budget for planning,

Identify the professionals who will be a part of the cultural planning process within the local authority and, when necessary, encourage their attendance at training programs that will strengthen professional skills and knowledge,

Document the planning process in the published plan,

Outline associated risks (e.g., increased expectations and inadequate resources; political conflicts.)

23 Creative City Network of Canada (2010). *Cultural Planning Toolkit*. p. 30.

1　D　STAKEHOLDERS

An essential component of culture is to set up partnerships. Collaboration, which requires the engagement of many, is one of the most important ways to ensure efficient planning and reach a large number of individuals. Sharing a common goal is the route that leads to efficient collaboration.

Internal Stakeholders

As pointed out by the strategic and integrated dimensions of cultural planning, there should be ongoing communication between a directorate of culture and the social, economic and environment-related departments. This requires internal stakeholders to embrace officials from different units. It is not possible to create a single universal chart since each municipality has a different number of directorates, which also differ in their names. However, the process should benefit considerably from continued communication between the department of culture and its associated units (e.g. directorates of libraries, education, social benefits, etc.) and urban planning units (e.g. directorates of plans and projects, survey and projects, technical works, parks and gardens, etc.).

It is also important that Mayor's Office, as the closest office to the Mayor, and the Directorate of Strategy Development, due to the significant part it plays in strategic planning, assume an active role in the process of coordination. In addition, city councils that operate under the municipalities should be active participants in the process.

External Stakeholders

External stakeholders are all actors other than the bodies that carry out the planning process such as public administration units, cultural institutions, non-governmental organizations, private sector representatives, education and research centers and independent actors that may have a say regarding culture. Engaging the maximum number of external stakeholders possible in the process will ensure that the plan is more successful and that its goals are achieved. Many municipalities outside Turkey have stated that external stakeholders such as cultural sector actors are actively involved in cultural planning.

In a mega-scale city like Istanbul, a great number of institutions, organizations and bodies can be considered as potential external stakeholders. Provincial directorates of culture and tourism; governor's offices; regional directorates of foundations and development agencies are some examples of potential external stakeholders in the public administration sector. On the other hand, museum directorates, cultural centers and the state theater are examples of public cultural institutions. Other external stakeholders may include the provincial and borough units of the central administration; city-dwellers; all non-governmental actors; non-governmental organizations; independent cultural institutions; associations; foundations, unions and artists' platforms; employee associations; education and research centers and universities.[24]

A good example that emphasizes the strengthening role culture plays in urban sustainability from the point of view of internal and external stakeholders in culture and arts is

---

[24] See Eylem Ertürk, *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı: Adımlar, Araçlar ve Örnekler* for a list of internal and external stakeholders in cultural planning. See Asu Aksoy ve Zeynep Enlil, *İstanbul 2010 Kültür Ekonomisi Envanteri* for an exhaustive list of cultural stakeholders in Istanbul, a large metropolitan city.

the Sinopale project. This is an international biennial project that has been running since 2006 under the leadership of the European Culture Association. Over time the project has evolved into an event that embraces and receives the support of a variety of stakeholders from the city of Sinop. Since 2006, the residents of Sinop, as well as Sinop-lovers, have been working in cooperation with the biennial for the good of their city. In May 2014, motivated by the cultural synergy that the Sinopale project had created, the Sustainable Development Association of Sinop was set up with the aim to "put cultural synergy into action to promote the social and economic development of the city." [25] Another project, the Sinop Meeting Point project, helps to design the headquarters of the association as a platform to develop social, cultural and economic services and products. The organizations that offer collaboration and support for the project include the municipality of Sinop; the European Culture Association and Sinopale; Chameleon Project Management and Design; the Creative Industries Research Center of Mimar Sinan University and The Streets Belong to Us Association. The initiative, which began as a cultural event, evolved into a permanent structure that serves the goal of creating a sustainable city and that received the support of the municipality and the governor's office while working in collaboration with public bodies, universities, civil society and the private sector.

25 Sustainable Development Association of Sinop. http://sinopdernegi.org

International Local Authority Organizations

In addition to urban actors, there also exist a number of international organizations to cooperate with that include culture among their sustainable development goals and which carry out inspiring activities on an international platform. Publications and meetings of such organizations are good sources of guidance in planning. The section below contains information about some of the international organizations that work to that end:

United Cities and Local Governments was set up in January 2004 with the aim of materialize the notion of democratic local authority on a global scale. UCLG is the largest local authority organization in the world[26] and it considers culture the main component of sustainable development. Kadir Topbaş, Mayor of Istanbul, has been acting as the president of UCGL for two terms.

The Agenda 21 for Culture, introduced by the Culture Commission of UCLG in 2004, is the first international-scale document that establishes culture-related principles and commitments for local authorities on the way to sustainable development. In the following years, UCLG adopted the "Culture as the Fourth Pillar of Development" statement.[27] After 2015, it drew attention to the indispensable role of culture in the United Nations Development Agenda.

[26] See http://www.tbb.gov.tr/dis-iliskiler/uluslararasi-iliskiler/birlesmis-kentler-ve-yerel-yonetimler-dunya-teskilati-uclg and http://www.uclg.org/en/organisation/about for detailed information about UCLG.
[27] See http://www.agenda21culture.net/index.php/docman/-1/393-zzculture4pillarsden/file for full text.

The first Culture Summit organized by UCLG in Bilbao originated with the idea that local authorities continue implementing the Agenda 21 for Culture. This document was revised for the first time in ten years to become **Culture 21: Actions** and was presented to the public at the end of this summit. The following local authorities from Turkey attended that Culture Summit: the metropolitan municipalities of Diyarbakır, Gaziantep, Istanbul, Izmir and Konya, as well as the local authorities of Nevşehir and Silivri, and the Union of Municipalities of Turkey. The next summit is planned to take place in 2017.

Another very important city-scale organization is the **Intercultural Cities Project** that is coordinated by the Council of Europe. This project aims to involve skills and creativity, key components of cultural diversity, in policy-making processes. It provides the participating cities with the opportunity to make use of expert opinions on cultural integration and to share experiences with other cities through various events and field trips.[28]

---

28 See http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Cities/Index/default_en.asp and http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Cities/JoiningICC_en.pdf for detailed information about the project.

Another organization that associates sustainable development and culture is the **World Cities Culture Forum**, which is hosted by the Mayor of London in cooperation with BOP. The Forum is based in London, which is considered the world capital for creative industries. Hosted on a rotating basis by member cities, this unique gathering allows city leaders to share ideas and knowledge about the role of culture as an organizing principle for the sustainable city of the future.[29] On the other hand, the comprehensive research made by BOP Consultancy is important in terms of evaluating the impact of culture and creativity depending on the different characteristics of cities and of sharing said research with the public to help with generating data-based policies.[30] The Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism represents Istanbul in this forum.

Another such project is the **Culture for Cities and Regions**[31] project funded by the Creative Europe program of the European Council. Local authorities participate in the project, which focuses on topics such as the role of culture and creative industries in local economic development and urban regeneration; cultural heritage as a driver of economic growth and social inclusion and the role of culture in social innovation and intercultural dialogue. This project aims to create a catalogue of best practices and to provide expert services on these topics to ten cities or regions through themed trips.

---

[29] See http://www.worldcitiescultureforum.com/about for detailed information about the forum
[30] See http://bop.co.uk for detailed information about BOP
[31] http://www.cultureforcitiesandregions.eu

The **UNESCO Creative Cities Network** was created in 2004 to promote international cooperation with and among cities that have identified creativity as a strategic factor for sustainable economic, social, cultural and environmental urban development while supporting UNESCO's cultural diversity ideals. Currently 116 cities across the world make up this network. The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, adopted by the international community in September 2015, emphasizes culture and creativity as key components of urban development. This network is an important platform that will contribute to the implementation and success of this international agenda. Members of the network are committed to developing cooperation and collaboration in order to improve creativity and their culture industry; share best practices; improve participation in cultural life and to integrate culture into their economic and social development strategies. The city of Gaziantep, with the support of the Turkish National Commission for UNESCO and under the leadership of its Metropolitan Municipality, has been designated one of the 17 members of the network in the field of "Gastronomy."[32]

Establishing collaboration between the local authorities in Turkey and these international networks and organizations would contribute to the development of local cultural policy. In order to strengthen such relations and collaboration, a greater number of local authority representatives, academics and culture professionals should be encouraged to join those networks and take part in current discussions.

[32] See http://unesco.org.tr/?page=15:248:1:turkce for detailed information.

2 | ACTION PLAN (STEPS AND TIMELINE)

This section aims to study some examples from outside Turkey to provide a stage-by-stage presentation of the cultural planning process and to assist with the strategic planning processes. The process of cultural planning consists of the following stages: preparation; research and data gathering; analysis; corporate processes and sharing; drafting; publication; implementation; monitoring and review. A sample timeline for each stage is given opposite.

Chart 2. Sample Timeline[33] *(The contents of this timeline change depending on scale and the type of planning used.)*

Stages / Months	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	+12
1. Preparation Select members for the planning team Distribute tasks Define framework for the plan	▓	▓											
2. Research and Information Gathering Cultural mapping Use participatory methods			▓	▓	▓								
3. Analysis Review Information Identify objectives Identify indicators						▓	▓	▓					
4. Institutional Processes and Involvement Develop draft plan Create budget and timeline							▓	▓					
5. Drafting the plan									▓	▓			
6. Public Presentation											▓		
7. Implementation											▓	▓	▓
8. Observation and Review											▓	▓	▓

---

33 Adapted from the timeline provided on p. 20 of *Cultural Planning Toolkit*

2 A PREPARATION (2 MONTHS)

Selecting members for the planning team

This stage requires the selection of individuals and organizations from within and outside the municipality who could contribute to the process of cultural planning and take an active part in the research, drafting, implementation and review processes. Successful cases of cultural planning reveal that it is helpful to have a high-ranking municipal official to undertake leadership and responsibility for the process. This allows the Mayor to take an active role in the process and eliminates bureaucratic obstacles. On the other hand, this individual should be in a position that allows them to coordinate with social, economic and environmental units as the strategic and integrated dimensions of cultural planning require. In addition to selecting a high-ranking official, setting up an administrative planning team at the start of the process would also prove to be beneficial.

Other actors to be included in the planning process are: a local authority unit that will coordinate cultural planning in the municipality; other individuals from relevant departments to act as members of the team; external stakeholders from relevant public institutions; NGOs; artists' platforms; neighborhood associations and international organizations.

In local authorities in New York, Amsterdam and Seoul, culture departments undertake the responsibility for the planning process. The culture department in Seoul is responsible for managing the process whereas the contents of the plan are prepared by a working team that consist of professionals from the Seoul Institute and the private sector. In Tokyo, the planning department of the metropolitan authority is responsible for the process and it works in collaboration with the municipal council. The arts and culture committee also contributes to the plan by making recommendations. According to Tokyo officials, one of the challenges that Tokyo faces during planning is adapting policy to the process. In Toronto, on the other hand, the municipal team responsible for drafting policies and programs also takes part in the planning process. All municipalities in Toronto have stated that they take the utmost care to include the greatest number of stakeholders possible in planning.

Task distribution

Once the stakeholders to be included in the process are selected from within and outside the municipality, organization and task distribution should be completed. It is important that priority is given to provide a job description for the leader and the planning team. This will help to eliminate possible future confusion that may result from a lack of concrete job descriptions. This should be followed by distributing tasks to the municipal and external individuals and organizations involved in the process. An advisor or a consulting body may also be a part of this process if necessary.

Question 2. Do you have a team that specializes on cultural planning?

Amsterdam	Yes. The Arts and Culture Department of the City of Amsterdam. The Head of the Arts and Culture Department has the main responsibility of the project. The project leader and other specialists take part in the consulting process and write policy chapters and visions.
New York	Yes, but detailed tasking models or levels have not been defined yet.
Seoul	Yes. While the Cultural Policy Division at the Seoul Metropolitan Government is administratively in charge of cultural planning for the city, it is done by the working group made up of researchers at the Seoul Institute and independent experts from the private sector. The draft plan prepared by the working group as well as major policy decisions are finalized at the Culture City Planning Committee composed of 47 members including department heads in the Seoul Metropolitan Government, representatives of the city council and cultural organizations as well as citizen members. [...]
Tokyo	Yes. The Planning and Coordination Section of Tokyo Metropolitan Government liaised closely with other sections and Tokyo Metropolitan Assembly, and administered policy making. Tokyo Arts and Culture Committee made policy recommendation to the governor. Arts Council Tokyo researched, analysed, and gathered data.
Toronto	No, we do not have a team specializing in cultural planning rather cultural plans have been created by policy and program staff together in consultation with the community.
Vienna	No.

Defining a framework for the plan

The scale of the plan needs to be defined, as well as what should be included in it (See Chart 1. Different Types of Cultural Planning, p. 22). The cultural area that will be the center of focus (e.g. culture and arts, tourism, crafts, protection of tangible and intangible heritage, etc.) and an order of priority must be established. The answer to whether the plan will cover the whole city or a single part of it (borough, neighborhood, etc.) will determine the scale of the plan.

The reviewed municipalities have stated that they have varying priorities in their plans. Either the whole urban population or a smaller portion of the population may be prioritized. Amsterdam stated that their planning process aims to extend culture and arts across the metropolitan and all its suburbs, in other words, across all parts of the city. This also clarifies the scale of their plan. The plan for Seoul 2030 declares it a priority to ensure participation in cultural life for all walks of life. Tokyo stated that they aim to assign culture an active role in urban development whereas Toronto expressed a desire to ensure constant improvement for creative capital. Vienna adopts a flexible planning approach that leaves some room for manoeuver for cultural actors.

2 B RESEARCH AND INFORMATION GATHERING (3 MONTHS)

Information gathering

The first stage of research is information gathering. Previous strategic and regional plans of the municipality should be reviewed in order to determine how culture should be associated with other areas of development. In addition to these documents a review of the existing statistical data and inventories relating to culture and the reports published by the Development Agency will help to gather data. Information relevant to this stage may also come from national and international cultural policy-making documents and sample plans.[34]

---

[34] See "Resources" for a list of documents and sample plans.

Chart 3. National and International Sources

National Sources	International Sources
Ada, S. (Ed.), Turkish Cultural Policy Report: A Civil Perspective	Council of Europe. Cultural Policy Report: Cultural Policy in Turkey National Report: http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Reviews/CDCPP-Bu-2013-2_Turkeyexperts_en.pdf
Ertürk, E. (Ed.), Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı: Adımlar, Araçlar ve Örnekler	Cultural policies in Europe: www.culturalpolicies.net/web/index.php
Culture Economy and Cultural Infrastructure Inventory Development Strategy in the City of Izmir www.izka.org.tr/files/planlama/2_bolge_plani_dokumanlari/2014-2023/izmir_kultur_stratejisi.pdf	World Cities Culture Forum reports: http://www.worldcitiescultureforum.com/publications
	Agenda 21 for Culture reports: http://www.agenda21culture.net/index.php/documents/reports
	National Cultural Policy Report of Turkey: http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Reviews/CDCPP-Bu-2013-19-Turkeynational_en.pdf
Cultural Heritage and Culture Inventory project www.envanter.gov.tr	United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) reports http://www.uclg.org
2014 Vision Report of the General Directorate of Cinema http://sinema.gov.tr/ana/sayfa.asp?id=360	IFACCA Online Bibliographies www.ifacca.org/links/onlinebibliographies
Culture statistics by the Turkish Statistical Institute www.tuik.gov.tr/PreTablo.do?al_id=1086	UNESCO reports and databases : http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/resources

Cultural mapping

Having a thorough understanding of the characteristics of the city or borough under consideration will provide the plan with a firm foundation. To this end it is necessary to identify the geographical, human, economic and cultural characteristics of the planning area. In other words, the cultural assets need to be identified. The following chart provides a detailed list of culture-related characteristics of the city. The list was taken from the "Getting to know our city" section of *Yerel Kültür Politikaları Kitabı* (Local Cultural Policies Book), compiled by Eylem Ertürk.[35]

35 Ertürk, E. (2011). *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı*. p.53.

Chart 4. Getting to know our city

GEOGRAPHY	
Physical properties	Natural formation that determines the physical structure of the city, mountain-sea relationship, etc.
Climate	Climate determining, restricting or expanding life in the city.
Neighbors	Neighboring cities and regions; points of contact with neighbors
Regional relations	Relations with neighboring cities, regions and countries

PEOPLE	
Population	Population characteristics; age and gender ratios; direction of change in recent years
Diversity	Diversity of social life; strong and weak areas of social cohesion
Movements of Migration	Rate and direction of change in migration to and from the city
Level of education	Educational attainment rates among citizens

ECONOMY	
Basic indicators Tourism	Per capita income | Economic structure | Employment opportunities |
	Agriculture – Industry – Service sector distribution | Regional development programs
	Infrastructure | Transportation, accommodation, guidance, tourism services, etc.
	Characteristics of the city | 3 properties/products/services that make the city stand out
	Potential | Infrastructure assessment, direction of development
	Cultural links | Areas within or outside the region where relationships intensify

CULTURE	
Culture Industries	Cinema | Music | Media | Press | Software | Design | Crafts
	Identify the existence of industries in the city
Cultural Venues	Institutions | Actors | Distribution of venues | Production | Number of employees | Turnover
	Cultural Centers | Concert Halls | Venues | Museums | Galleries | Libraries | Theaters | Opera and Ballet Halls | Cinemas
	Infrastructure | Capacity | Events | Level of use | Number of audience numbers | Investment
Cultural Assets	Antique cities | Protected areas | Archeological, natural, urban historic, archeological registered buildings | Civil, religious, cultural, administrative, military, industrial and commercial architecture
	Cemeteries, Martyrs' cemeteries, Monuments and memorials, Natural assets, Ruins, Protected streets
	Properties of venues | Number and distribution of visitors | Investment

Cultural mapping is the most commonly used method for establishing cultural assets. Cultural mapping, through the use of participatory methods, can be utilized, as existing statistical data in Turkey is too limited to facilitate access to such cultural assets.

The following need to be identified as part of cultural mapping: abstract means of expression such as the lifestyles, cultural habits and beliefs of the communities of locals living in the planning area; arts events, festivals, cultural and arts education resources that affect the life quality of citizens and venues and open spaces, places of worship, cafes and restaurants that have become a part of cultural life.

A good example of cultural mapping is "CultureMap London," a project funded by Arts Council England. The project was launched by Audience London, which is an independent not for profit agency that supports organizations in the cultural sector. CultureMap London consists of an interactive resource that maps data on cultural engagement and production across the city of London. It brings together a number of indicators into one place, and provides a tool that can support understanding of audiences and strategic decision making.[36]

Another method that can be used to gain a multi-perspective understanding of the cultural structure of a city is SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats) analysis. SWOT aims to identify a city's strengths and weaknesses as well as the opportunities and threats that it may face in the future. When culture is in question, such an analysis should be carried out on culture- related areas.

Using participatory methods

When establishing a city's cultural assets, it is important to get the opinions of both the city's local residents and the urban cultural actors such as NGOs. Traditional methods such as surveys, personal interviews, focus groups or broader meetings can be used. Other methods that will allow for citizen participation in the planning process are social media interaction projects, exhibitions, musical events and performances, festivals and other creative events.

The survey, which is a traditional method, contains structured questions and aims to receive answers that define a specific situation. For example, the survey method can be used to find out "how often" and "how many" people attend arts events in a specific planning zone. However, where findings that will allow for a more comprehensive description are needed rather than brief answers, it is recommended that the in-depth interview method be used. This method is an important source of data that allows for in-depth explanations for results such as the impact of arts events in the planning zone on the daily life; groups of people that do not have access to such events and the reasons for such lack of access.

The results of the survey carried out on the reviewed local authorities outside Turkey show that they have difficulty ensuring the participation of citizens from all segments in the planning processes and that they are working to find creative ways to overcome this challenge.

New York states that the biggest challenge they face during cultural planning is to ensure the participation of the greatest number of residents possible. According to New York, ensuring participation becomes even more difficult as urban population becomes larger and more diverse. New York also stated that they have reviewed the plans of some other cities and consulted with colleagues from those cities. In addition, a Citizens Advisory Commission has been set up in New York, as required by a recently adopted regulation. This commission has been given the task of making recommendations for developing and implementing a plan. It is also responsible for reviewing that plan.

Toronto also stated that the most important challenge they face during planning is to ensure the participation of the elderly, the youth and various disadvantaged groups in the process.

Amsterdam, on the other hand, stated that the culture sector is involved in planning but that they are currently looking for new ways of engaging the audience in the process.

As these cases show, it is possible to use more than one participatory method. Focus groups and information-gathering workshops will be discussed later in this report.

Focus Group Discussions

Focus group discussions are held in the form of a closed meeting with a small group and it aims to get the opinion of the members of the group on a specific subject. This method has the goal of understanding stakeholder perception, tendencies, attitude and behavior. For example, if an arts event causes problems between residents and artists in the planning zone, meeting with the two focus groups involved would allow for a thorough understanding of areas of sensitivity for both parties. This helps to establish objectives that will make living together possible and increase the quality of life.[37]

---

[37] Creative City Network of Canada (2010). *Cultural Planning Toolkit.* p.22

Question 3. Does cultural planning adopt a participatory approach?

Amsterdam	Yes. This is something we look at more and more. Cultural sector is mainly involved. Populations at the moment are involved via the political arena. We are thinking of new ways to include the audience in this process.
New York	Yes. New York's cultural plan will engage city residents in the planning process. Extensive outreach seeking input to be incorporated into the plan. The legislation also requires that DCLA establish a Citizens' Advisory Committee, which will advise the development and implementation of the plan, and will review DCLA's biannual reports on the progress of the plan – which are also required by the legislation. The plan itself will be reviewed and revised every ten years as necessary, and the CAC will be dissolved after making recommendations following its review of the second biannual report, or after five years.
Seoul	Yes. A postcard survey was used to gather citizens' opinions. For three months between November 2014 and January 2015, a set of postcards containing the question "What do you think the Seoul city should be doing to help you better enjoy culture?" was distributed to public cultural spaces across the city such as community service centers, cultural centers, arts centers, youth centers, and community welfare centers. [...] A public opinion-gathering program called "Ask 100,000 Citizens" was opened on the Seoul's official website to ensure the public's voice was heard on cultural planning [...]. [C]itizens will be given another opportunity to participate by reviewing the finalized plan at "public hearings" for local residents in each area and/or an "open forum" with 1,000 citizen and expert panelists attending.
Tokyo	Yes. We had released the draft of the Tokyo Vision for Arts and Culture to the public, and called for comments about the draft. We incorporated the comments from the private sector and the citizens of Tokyo to the vision.
Toronto	Yes. Stakeholder consultations/public advisory committees, Town Hall meetings and online public consultations are essential to the planning process.
Vienna	Yes. Local population is encouraged to organize and establish their own district and/or cultural interest groups and can come with their demands and apply for funding from us. Artists and other culture workers are encouraged to establish their special interest groups in the different art and culture fields (For example: fine arts, theatre, music, literature etc.) and we contribute financially to the running of these interest groups which have their members and information organs etc.

Information-Gathering Workshops

Organizing workshops is a useful method for identifying cultural resources, allowing different voices to be heard and ensuring stakeholder participation. It facilitates the exchange of thoughts between participants about cultural resources while helping to build a solid foundation for the initial stage of cultural planning. These workshops may also be organized simultaneously in small breakout groups formed according to different areas of interest. Facilitators in each breakout group would then use a discussion guide and record the ideas that each group agrees on. The information recorded from each group should be combined and shared with the public in written form.

An example of an information-gathering workshop is the Izmır Culture Economy Workshop, which focuses on the economic dimension of culture. The Izmir Culture Economy Inventory and Culture Economy Strategy Project aims to provide extensive research and analysis to unleash the potential of culture as the city's development strategy. This project was launched in collaboration with Ege University as part of a protocol signed between The School of Architecture at Dokuz Eylul University and IZKA (Izmir Development Agency) as a preliminary effort for the Agency's 2014 to 2023 Izmir Regional Plan.

The first stage of the project consisted of drawing up an inventory of the culture economy, cultural infrastructure and cultural agents. This was then followed by the Izmir Culture Economy workshop, which aimed to gather participants' opinions to create a strategy for developing Izmir's culture economy. In order to achieve its aim, the workshop brought together individuals from relevant university departments; local and central government representatives; trade associations and non-governmental organizations as well as individuals and companies operating in the private sector. Through participatory methods, it searched for an answer to the question "What strategy should Izmir's cultural economy use?" The groups taking part in the workshop generated ideas on the questions, which were defined according to their strategic priority.

2 C ANALYSIS (3 MONTHS)

Review of Information

Review of data collected during the information-gathering phase will reveal principal components useful for planning. Accordingly, the collected information should be examined in its entirety, within the framework of the cultural plan, and in concert with the strategic and comprehensive approach on which the cultural plan is built. At the conclusion of this process, the core themes, priorities, and objectives of the plan should become firmly evident.

Identifying Objectives

The following questions can help determine objectives:[38]

What changes are expected following the inclusion of cultural strategy in public planning?

What changes in the city or borough do you foresee in the mid to long term?

What problems in the city or borough do you hope to solve using cultural resources?

What is the expected impact of culture on the economic, social and environmental problems in the city or borough?

What are your concrete objectives in terms of social change?

What new skills are persons and institutions directly involved in the process expected to acquire? What are the long, mid and short-term aims?

---

[38] Ertürk, Eylem. *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı*, p.86

After identifying objectives:

Are the objectives concrete, quantifiable, accessible and suited to needs?

Do the objectives strike a balance between commercial and social benefits?

Is there a set timeframe and budget for the objective?

How can the changes and progress towards objectives be quantified?

The 'analysis' section also sets the indicators to be used in the review phase. Data uncovered during the analysis should be discussed with the planning team

Identifying indicators:

Indicators help determine whether goals for culture-based social development were accomplished, what the success rate was, and what points should be further emphasized for success. In other words, while statistical data provides voluminous empirical information, the purpose of indicators is to distill this material into fewer, more easily quantifiable pieces.

These indicators, however, will not be the same across different municipalities. Rather than using a standard set of indicators, they should be customized based on detailed local fieldwork and research. For example, UNESCO's Culture for Development Indicators Project[39] aims to see how culture lowers poverty rates and facilitates efforts towards social cohesion, human development, and the realization of peace.

---

[39] The Culture for Development Indicators Project. http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/cultural-diversity/cultural-expressions/programmes/culture-for-development-indicators/moreinformation

The European Union's working group on the subject, meanwhile, suggests indicators regarding public sector culture spending, household culture spending, cultural diversity, intangible cultural heritage, and creative economies. This shows how international institutions have made concrete efforts towards defining cultural indicators. Their reports provide valuable information and recommendations that should be useful for municipal authorities of all scales.

The Turkish Statistical Institute does gather cultural statistics, but this data is not granular enough to present meaningful insight at the borough and neighborhood scale. Consequently, indicators based on local and international research and on a city's socio-cultural traits have not really been developed. This requires thorough research, for which municipalities, universities and NGOs need to work together and come up with indicators that make sense at the local level, which in turn would greatly benefit the field of cultural policy.

Research suggests that cultural indicators are effective in quantifying the sustainable development of a city, borough or neighborhood, and in measuring increases in the welfare and quality of life of communities. Indicators also prove that participation in cultural activities have positive effects on the physical and mental health of persons, promote a feeling of belonging and increase their willingness to share. On the other hand, municipal cultural plans reviewed in this report make it clear that quantifying cultural indicators based purely on numerical data would be inadequate. (See Comparison of Municipal Strategic Plans, p.75)

Cultural indicators already in use by municipalities skew heavily towards those based on statistical data, such as the number of events, level of public awareness, rate of increase in event attendance, number of cultural centers, level of satisfaction with events, number of monuments to be restored or the number of public parks to be built. It would be helpful, however, if more qualitative indicators measuring social benefit were also included in cultural planning.

One municipality reviewed in this study, for instance, states in their strategic plan that their goal is to "strengthen our position as the center of cultural and artistic life." Accordingly, their performance targets are to increase artistic and social events and foster the appearance of a borough and city in which people from diverse cultural backgrounds can live in harmony. The indicators they track in order to assess their targets include, among others, the number of events, public awareness of these events, public satisfaction with these events, and the number of cultural and youth centers. Cultural planning, however, calls for a focus on neighborhoods that are culturally diverse – even where this causes tensions – and a study of how effective public spaces and cultural events are in these areas at facilitating a culture of peaceful co-existence between communities. In other words, instead of focusing on statistical indicators, more effective indicators should emphasize finding spaces and venues that would better facilitate the participation and interaction of different cultural communities, and whether people have a sense of belonging in these public spaces.

Quantitative indicators provide statistics that are useful to track changes over time whereas qualitative indicators are based on accounts.[40] Examples of such indicators can be found in UNESCO's *Culture for Development Indicators: Methodology Manual* publication.[41] For instance, a qualitative indicator could be the role of minority communities[42] – in terms of their access to cultural services and professionals – in decision-making processes regarding cultural policy. Whether or not cultural actors have an active role in the planning process, and how binding their input is to the decision making process are a component of this indicator, and answers to questions in Chart 5 can be used to formulate it.

[40] IFACCA. *Statistical Indicators for Arts Policy*. p.16.
http://media.ifacca.org/files/statisticalindicatorsforartspolicy.pdf
[41] UNESCO. *Culture for Development Indicators: Methodology Manual*. p.76.
http://en.unesco.org/creativity/sites/creativity/files/digital-library/CDIS%20Methodology%20Manual_0.pdf
[42] The term 'minority' is used here after the definition set forth in the UNESCO publication *Our Creative Diversity* (1996): "The term 'minorities' […] designates marginalized or vulnerable groups who live in the shadow of majority populations with a different and dominant cultural ideology. These groups share systems of values and sources of self esteem that often are derived from sources quite different from those of the majority culture." p.71

Chart 5. Civil Society Participation Indicator

PARTICIPATION OF MINORITIES

Are there institutional mechanisms or organic structures (periodic meetings, committees) providing a framework or neutral forum for dialogue between representatives of minorities and administration officials in processes related to the formulation, management, implementation and/or evaluation of cultural policies, measures and programmes that concern them? *These mechanisms or structures could be exclusively dedicated to culture or could be dedicated to broader issues that may treat culture as a thematic or transversal issue.*

Can they be considered active (official meeting held in the last 24 months)? Or not (no official meeting held in the last 24 months)?

Are they permanent in nature (e.g. committees)? Or ad hoc (e.g. meetings)?

Are their resolutions binding? Or are they consultative?

PARTICIPATION OF CULTURE PROFESSIONALS

Are there institutional mechanisms or organic structures (periodic meetings, committees) that provide for participation by representatives of culture sector professionals (guilds, associations, networks, etc.) in processes related to the formulation and implementation of cultural policies, measures and programmes that concern them?

2 **D** **INSTITUTIONAL PROCESSES AND INVOLVEMENT (2 MONTHS)**

Developing a draft plan

The outline text should be shared, first with the planning team and then with outside stakeholders for their review in order to strengthen the comprehensiveness of the cultural planning process.

Suggested topics to be included in the plan at this stage are listed below:

The importance of culture in terms of planning,

The relationship between cultural planning and the municipal authority's other policies, strategies and activities,

Relation to development agencies' regional planning strategies,

Relation of the plan to local and national cultural policies,

The participatory aspect of the planning process, involved outside stakeholders,

Quantitative and qualitative data demonstrating community cultural resources,

Objectives,

Budget and timeline,

Implementation process,

Distribution of roles.

Creating the budget and timeline

After determining what branches of the municipal authority will be involved with the planning process, who will be on the team and who will lead efforts, and who the external stakeholders will be, a budget will need to be set for the research and implementation stages. Additionally, it would be helpful to study various outside sources of funding, and their application requirements and processes.

It is important that the administrators of the project solidify all of these processes and other stages of planning in a timeline. The particulars of the chart will, however, depend on the type of cultural planning (see Chart 1. Different Types of Cultural Planning, p.22) being pursued.

For instance, a project to map cultural resources in a defined planning area could take up to a year, depending on how prepared the municipal institutional background is for such a project, whereas a plan consisting only of a review of a cultural or artistic area could be prepared in a much shorter timeframe if the relevant data already exists.

The timeframe required to prepare a full cultural plan with all attendant processes will also vary depending on the size of the planning area, but will likely be on the longer end of the scale in Turkey, where the conception of cultural planning is not widespread. Timelines will differ subject to the municipality's approach to cultural planning, its institutional infrastructure, and the availability of data resources. Chart 2 (p.35), provided at the beginning of the 'Course of Action' section is aimed at demonstrating how all the steps can be programmed across one year.

Likewise, the timeframe for the renewal of cultural plans will again depend on the conditions and needs of the city for which they are made. As the survey of international local authorities demonstrates, planning renewal periods can range from one or two years up to ten years. When asked about their cultural plans, Amsterdam for instance is committed to renewing its plan every four years, whereas New York, which will only publish its first cultural plan in 2017, hopes to renew it every ten years thereafter. Seoul, a mega city with over 10 million inhabitants, followed its plan for 2015 with one aimed at the year 2030. This second plan, however, will be reviewed every five years. Vienna, on the other hand, which could be called a culture and arts oriented city, does not have a fixed schedule with which it publishes cultural plans. All of this shows us that each city has different needs, has a different scale and population distribution, and has many other variables, all of which plays a role in setting the timeframe for both the preparation and renewal of their cultural plans.

Question 4. Do you have a set timeframe for cultural planning?

Amsterdam	Yes. The City's Plan for the Arts presents the cultural policies and ambitions for four consecutive years. Preparations for the next plan start at the beginning of the 3rd year of the current plan, leading up to decision making at the end of the 3rd year and in the last 2 quarters of the 4th year.
New York	Yes. The legislation requires that New York City's cultural plan be delivered by July 1, 2017. It will be reviewed and revised every ten years, as necessary.
Seoul	Yes. [...] The plan will be monitored, assessed and updated every five years pursuant to the Local Culture and Arts Promotion Act by the national government.
Tokyo	Yes
Toronto	No there is no schedule for preparing cultural plans but one major plan has been produced every decade since the 1990's.
Vienna	No.

2 E DRAFTING THE PLAN (2 MONTHS)

After the various stakeholders have a chance to review an initial draft of the plan, they will have suggestions to improve it, which should then be evaluated by the planning team and worked into the final plan. Significant themes that could to be reviewed at this stage can be summarized thus:

Is the importance of culture in the planning process, and its relationship to other aspects of development clearly communicated?

Are details of the planning process provided?

Are the significance of key findings, observations, and feedback explained, and their importance for the applicability of the plan emphasized?

Do the indicators selected upon analysis comprise all aspects of local development (economic, social, environmental, and cultural), just like the goals of the plan do?

In light of these questions, the planning team will put finishing touches on the draft, and the plan will be submitted to all involved parties and the mayor.

International municipalities, when asked to evaluate their planning process and indicate the criteria that are most critical to them, have provided a range of responses depending on their various priorities. Whereas for some, the participatory aspect of the plan was cited as essential, Amsterdam emphasized the role of culture for the whole city and Tokyo pointed out culture's role in urban development. Toronto, on the other hand, chose to stress the relationship between culture and the local economy. At the final stages of drafting the cultural plan, it would be helpful to make a similar assessment and make sure that the results of this evaluation be consistent with the copy of the overall plan.

Question 5. What is the most significant criterion for cultural planning?

Amsterdam	To strengthen culture and the role of culture throughout the whole city.
New York	Any effective and viable plan must include input and feedback from a broad range of people – including residents, government representatives, local leaders, cultural experts, and more – to produce something that is credible and able to generate buy in from the public and policy makers.
Seoul	The 2030 Seoul Cultural Plan aims to make Seoul a city of cultural citizens beyond the city of culture. It is designed to create a favorable environment and provide individual citizens with the right to cultural enjoyment by improving the city's cultural environment. To this end, the Seoul Metropolitan Government came up with 24 task areas based on all-round cooperation among individuals, communities, regions and the entire city. And during this process, the opinion-gathering from citizens were most valued.
Tokyo	It is to show the efficacy of the culture in the urban development.
Toronto	In Toronto, the most important criterion in a cultural plan is embracing the creative capital concept and driving it forward aggressively. In recent years, a cultural plan that cultivates the "creative city" has become popular with city planners eager to employ this strategy. However, it is still early days and the methodology is still a little uncertain and clumsy but the outcomes are helpful as 'lessons learned' going forward in the future.
Vienna	That there is no special plan, the most important criterion is to leave the cultural dynamics to the cultural players in the city.

2 F PUBLIC PRESENTATION (1 MONTH)

The process of presenting the report to the public follows its completion. It is suggested that the first thing to do is to get together with all stakeholders and collaborate to effectively present the plan to the public.

During this stage, it is recommended that all stakeholders be asked for their suggestions on how best to implement the process. The finalized report can be unveiled through the press, and simultaneously also online. The process could also work like in Tokyo's example. The City of Tokyo shared the plan with the public while it was still in draft form, and invited feedback from individuals. Their input, as well as that of the private sector, was then included in the final report.

2 G IMPLEMENTATION (~12 +)

The public presentation stage is followed by the implementation process, in accordance with the timeline. It would be helpful during this stage to stay faithful to the framework of the plan and to the distribution of roles in the planning team, and also be mindful of the qualitative and quantitative indicators set forth in the plan. The municipal official charged with leading the process should be forceful in overcoming bureaucratic red-tape and facilitating communication between involved parties.

| **2** | **H** | **OBSERVATION AND REVIEW** (12+ and throughout the implementation stage) |

Identifying the difficulties encountered during the preparation and implementation phases is important both because it allows for amending deficiencies in the plan, and because this information is invaluable to share with other municipalities who may wish to observe and learn from the cultural planning process. It is also suggested that the plan's progress is reviewed annually based on the set indicators (see the 'Identifying Indicators' section under 'Analysis', p. 51).

Question 6. How do you assess the effectiveness of cultural plans?

Amsterdam	Organizations receiving funds are observed annually for as long as the plan is in effect. The plan itself is evaluated every four years.
New York	DCLA will produce biannual reports on the progress of the plan, which will be made public and reviewed by City Council, the Citizen's Advisory Committee, and other bodies. More qualitative assessments will also be made as the plan is created and implemented.
Seoul	The practical set of Key Performance Indicators(KPI)s of the 2030 Seoul Cultural Plan, a comprehensive measurement that will look into whether the tasks executed on an annual basis until 2030, will be factored in the budget planning of the Headquarters of Culture at the municipal government and will be assessed based on its performance-based budget control system.
Tokyo	It enables us to take fiscal measure to realise the plan.
Toronto	In assessing the effectiveness of cultural plans, a measurement of success should tie back to the recommendations in the document *Creative Capital Gains - An Action Plan for Toronto:* To what extent have we been successful in ensuring a supply of affordable, sustainable cultural space – where and how much? How successful have we been in ensuring access and opportunity for cultural participation to all citizens - i.e. is there an increase in attendance and participation; amount of cultural activity being funded outside the downtown core, number of new and emerging artists that are being funded; number of new collaborations that are being supported as well as fundraising capacity of small and medium sized arts organizations? Have we supported the development of creative clusters and emerging cultural scenes to capitalize on their potential as generators of jobs and economic growth – where strategically and how much? To what extent have we promoted Toronto's cultural institutions, festivals and other assets to enhance its position as a creative city regionally, nationally and internationally? Have we kept pace with international competitors by making a firm commitment to sustain Toronto's cultural sector and position Toronto as a leading, globally competitive creative capital? Also specifically we measure the number of cultural workers employed in Toronto; what the creative industries contribute to Toronto's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and number of tourists that participate in cultural events here in Toronto.
Vienna	We think our proceeding is very successful, as more and more people come from outside to do cultural activities in Vienna.

It is possible to involve a variety of institutions and stakeholders in the observation and review processes. In our survey of international municipalities, The City of New York emphasized that an advisory committee of citizens, in addition to the city council, was tasked with reviewing the plan.

Any discrepancies between what was planned and what is actually implemented should be noted in the review process, along with what caused the divergence. To this end, the following questions could be useful in observing the coordination between the plan and the needs of local residents:

What is the response of local residents affected by the planning process?

Were the participatory processes satisfactory?

Did the implementation actually make a difference in the planning zone?

Did the realization of the plan have any detrimental effects on the lives of local residents?

Was it possible to provide an accessible and sustainable cultural zone for citizens?

Were cultural institutions adequately supported?

It should also be assessed during this stage whether the two main features of cultural planning, namely the integrated and strategic approach, were realized:

Was there adequate cooperation between various units of the municipality during the planning and implementation stages?

Was the strategic significance of culture a factored into urban development projects in the area?

Our survey of international municipalities has shown that each city faced a different set of difficulties in their attempt to design and implement a cultural plan depending on their unique circumstances. On the other hand, answers seemed to converge on the difficulty of effectively handling the various participatory processes.

Question 7. What were the most common challenges you faced during the planning process?

Amsterdam	Striking a balance between creative development through experimentation and inventiveness, maintaining the vitality of the cultural space, a focus on institutions, and broader political ideals.
New York	To set the scope of the plan, build a consensus, encourage robust public participation in the planning process, and to present a plan that addresses New York's particular strengths and circumstances.
Seoul	How can we gather opinions from citizens in Seoul, a megacity with a population of more than 10 million? How can we ensure that we are engaged with the right citizen groups who can represent the general public? What is the best way for citizens to participate in the planning process? These are some of the challenges that we have faced most frequently during the planning process.
Tokyo	The most frequent challenges are to adjust the cross departmental policy, and account to the financial administration section.
Toronto	Making sure that the elderly, young and disadvantaged communities get heard.
Vienna	We did not want to guide the process more than is necessary. We want to provide space for cultural actors to shape the course of their field. On the other hand, we could provide infrastructure or supply funds. Our focus is to foster a culture of heritage and memory through artworks and cultural events.

CONCLUSION

The aim of this report is to provide an introduction to cultural planning for municipal authorities through the study of local and international examples. It shows how cultural planning – a relatively new process for local authorities – is closely linked to sustainable development and citizens' rights, and how culture can play a major role in improving the quality of life of urban dwellers. It also advocates that, in addition to its noticeable effect on the creative city model and the economy, culture can positively influence the ability of inhabitants to live together, and should thus be included in all planning efforts.

Recent studies show that well designed and solidly implemented, participatory cultural plans are developed more effectively by local authorities as opposed to national governments.[43] To this end, this report underscores the fundamental stages and processes that can serve to guide such efforts at all scales, regardless of the differences between national, city, or borough level. It stresses the importance of realizing existing cultural potential through partnerships.

As the concept of cultural planning slowly gains ground in Turkey, it is important for the effective deployment of municipal funds that studies in this field are expanded, that good practices are identified, and that a performance based planning system – based on both quantitative and qualitative indicators – is adopted. The creation of national or local databases tracking cultural markers would also be invaluable in allowing for decision-making processes based on data and analysis. Municipal authorities could lead this effort.

---

43 Blomkamp, E. (2011). Comparing the Uncertain Terrain of Local Cultural Governance in Australia and New Zealand. *Australian Political Science Association Conference.* Canberra, Accessed on: January 8, 2016. http://www.academia.edu/934681/Comparing_the_Uncertain_Terrain_of_Local_Cultural_Governance_in_Australia_and_New_Zealand

Urban conditions today and an increasingly prevalent environment of conflict and migrations suggest that culture will have a much broader impact on our future than we might have thought in the past. It is likely that in the future, local authorities will have a larger impact in their citizens' access to and participation in cultural life. Our present-day situation also shows we cannot rely solely on market forces for mid and long term solutions to the viability of co-habitation and sustainable development.

We hope that this study will be helpful for local authorities who plan the future of our cities and set their cultural policies, and for all others in creating accessible and inclusive cities that bring together different communities in providing creative and sustainable cultural spaces.

ANNEXES

ANNEX   1   LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Pursuant to the Municipalities Act No. 5393, municipalities are defined as public legal entities founded in order to meet the local and collective needs of city, borough or village inhabitants, the foundational basis of which are written in law, whose executive shall be elected by the people, and the governance and finances of which shall be independent. Article 41 of said law mandates municipalities with preparing strategic plans by stating that "The mayor shall, within six months of local municipal elections, in adherence with the development plan and, if it exists, with the regional plan, prepare a strategic plan, and before the end of the relevant year an annual performance plan, which he/she shall submit to the city council. The strategic plan is prepared with the input of universities and NGOs, and is implemented following the city council's ratification."[44]

Article 13 of the municipalities act states that, in the context of the preparation of a strategic plan, local residents have a right to participate in municipal decision-making and services, and that they shall be assisted by the local authority in their efforts. Municipal governments should therefore – within their physical area of responsibility – strive to improve social and cultural relations and protect cultural heritage, all the while ensuring the participation of universities, trade associations, unions, NGOs and experts in the field.

[44] For the complete text, see: http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.5393.pdf

In addition to said law, article 7 of The Metropolitan Municipalities Law No. 5216 provides that metropolitan municipalities, when preparing their strategic plans, must consult with local borough authorities within their physical area of responsibility.

Another law compelling municipalities to prepare strategic plans is the Public Finances Management and Control Law No. 5018. Article 9 of this law states that "Public authorities prepare plans based on their strategic goals and measure their effectiveness through pre-determined indicators in order to shape their mission and vision regarding their development plans, programs, related regulations and the basic principles they've adopted."[45]

To this end, because of their involvement in the preparation and implementation of strategic plans, municipalities are also in partnership with development agencies. Article 5 of the Law on the Foundation, Coordination and Responsibilities of Development Agencies, dated February 7, 2006, states that development agencies shall assist local authorities within their area of responsibility.[46]

The preparation of strategic plans follow a guide, published by the State Planning Organization, on Strategic Planning for Public Directorates and the Code of Procedures and Principles Regarding Strategic Planning in Public Directorates.

Municipalities first prepared their strategic plans in the 2006 to 2009 period pursuant to the relevant article in Law No. 5018 being published in the *Official Gazette* on May 26, 2006.

---

[45] For the complete text, see: http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.5018.pdf
[46] For the complete text, see: http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2006/02/20060208-1.htm

Seeking laws and regulations that have direct impact on cultural life and local authorities' planning procedures, we would also encounter Law No. 2863 on The Preservation of Cultural and Natural Resources. This law intends to "define cultural and natural resources worth preserving, regulate procedures and activities around them, and to decide the foundation and responsibilities of the organizations that are to decide and implement these efforts."[47]

An amendment made to this law in 2004 provides that activities regarding cultural resources will now be regulated by cultural preservation, implementation, and inspection bureaus (KUDEB) active within municipalities, metropolitan municipalities, and provincial special administrations tasked by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Another change wrought by this amendment was that, for the first time, the concept of planning was "decoupled from the preservation of physical buildings, and was now also a strategic document embracing the ideal that it should strive to improve the social and economic wellbeing of people and businesses within the planning area, and create employment and added value."[48] The authority of KUDEB bureaus are regulated via the "By-law on the Foundation, Permit and Working Principles of Preservation, Implementation and Inspection Bureaus, Project Bureaus and Educational Units" enacted on June 11, 2005.

Law No. 5366 on The Renovation and Preservation Through Use of Worn Historical and Cultural Sites, enacted in 2005, assigns responsibility on the preservation of sites and definition of renewal areas to metropolitan municipalities, local authorities and – if applicable – to provincial special administrations.

---

47 For the complete text, see:
http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.2863&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch
48 Dinçer, İ. & Enlil, Z. & Ünsal, D. (2011). Historical and Cultural Heritage. *Sivil Toplum Gözüyle Kültür Politikası Raporu.* p. 77.

This law aims that "metropolitan municipalities and borough municipalities within them, provincial municipalities, boroughs, and all municipalities with over 50,000 inhabitants – and where such authorities don't apply special provincial administrations – shall oversee the rehabilitation and renovation, in accordance with regional development, of sites and areas that have been worn and are in danger of losing their attributes, and areas that have been designated worthy of protection by committees on the preservation of cultural and natural resources, in order to provide housing, commercial space, cultural areas and social public spaces, and to protect these areas against natural disasters by repairing, rebuilding and preserving them through use."[49]

Thus, the preservation and renovation of immovable cultural resources are subject to permits from KUDEB, General Directorate for Foundations, or the Regional Preservation Council. Amendments to Law No. 2863 of 2011 on the Protection of Natural and Cultural Resources went on to split Preservation Councils in two. Cultural resources were places under the responsibility of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, whereas natural resources were now under the protection of the Ministry of the Environment and Urbanism. Article 3 of statutory decree No. 648 (August 17, 2011) and article 6 of statutory decree No. 644 were amended with clause (g), which provides that the "General Directorate for the Protection of Natural Resources" was founded under the Ministry of the Environment and Urbanism. Submissions to this directorate are reviewed by "Regional Natural Protection Commissions." Commissions for the Protection

49 For the complete text, see: http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.5366.pdf

of Cultural and Natural Resources, on the other hand, were consolidated under the name "Cultural Resources Protection Commissions", thus separating the bureaucracy regarding cultural and natural resources and placing them under the umbrella of two different government ministries. This new arrangement introduces the principle that Preservation High Commission decisions will be binding over those of Regional Commissions, causing variations in the responsibility and authority of agencies tasked with the preservation of cultural resources.

Expanding the scope to internationally binding accords regarding cultural rights, one encounters the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, ratified and opened for signatures by the United Nations (UN) in 1996, it recognizes that "in accordance with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the ideal of free human beings enjoying freedom from fear and want can only be achieved if conditions are created whereby everyone may enjoy his economic, social and cultural rights, as well as his civil and political rights."[50] Cultural rights listed in article 15 of the covenant were listed as:

"1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone:

(a) To take part in cultural life;

(b) To enjoy the benefits of scientific progress and its applications;

(c) To benefit from the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author.

---

[50] For the complete text, see: http://www.unmikonline.org/regulations/unmikgazette/06turkish/ TIntCovEcSocCulRights.pdf

2. The steps to be taken by the States Parties to the present Covenant to achieve the full realization of this right shall include those necessary for the conservation, the development and the diffusion of science and culture.

3. The States Parties to the present Covenant undertake to respect the freedom indispensable for scientific research and creative activity.

4. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the benefits to be derived from the encouragement and development of international contacts and co-operation in the scientific and cultural fields."[51]

General Comment 21 of the UN Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Commission further states that "Communities and cultural associations play a fundamental role in the promotion of the right of everyone to take part in cultural life at the local and national levels, and in cooperating with States parties in the implementation of their obligations under article 15, paragraph 1."[52]

Another internationally binding treaty on cultural rights is the 2007 Fribourg Declaration. It expands on issues of identity, cultural heritage and cultural expression and interpretation by adding clauses on artistic expression and creativity, communication and information, cultural cooperation, the right to participate in and be part of cultural life.

The ideal that cultural rights are a fundamental component of human rights is further strengthened by the 2001 UNESCO Declaration on Cultural Diversity, and the 2005 UNESCO Convention on the Diversity of Cultural Expressions,[53] which Turkey has signed but not yet ratified. Article 13 of the convention discusses the relationship between culture and

---

51 ibid.
52 For the complete text, see: http://www.refworld.org/docid/4ed35bae2.html
53 For the complete text, see: http://en.unesco.org/creativity/convention/about/2005-convention-text

sustainable development, and invites parties to the convention to include culture in development processes.[54] This treaty and associated procedures are carried out by the UNESCO Turkish National Commission and all related information is publicly available.

Documents at the local scale include Agenda 21 for Culture,[55] ratified under the 2004 Universal Forum of Cultures, which happens to be the world's first mission statement providing resources to cities and local authorities for cultural development. Upon ratification of the document, the United Cities and Local Governments Organization (UCLG), which coordinates the process, took Agenda 21 for Culture as its fundamental reference document.

[54] UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions, 2005, Article 13: "Integration of culture in sustainable development: Parties shall endeavor to integrate culture in their development policies at all levels for the creation of conditions conducive to sustainable development and, within this framework, foster aspects relating to the protection and promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions" http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=31038&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html
[55] For more information on Agenda 21 for Culture, see: http://www.agenda21culture.net/index.php/who-we-are/mission

ANNEX	**2**			**COMPARISON OF MUNICIPAL STRATEGIC PLANS**
ANNEX	**2**	A		CULTURE IN STRATEGIC PLANS
ANNEX	**2**	A	1	MISSION/VISION

	Mission	**Vision**
Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality	Responding to needs yet uncovered with a twenty-first century approach to local governance, perfecting municipal services in an institutional manner, and promoting the City's cultural identity.	Local authority for a city that is run with sustainable and innovative methods that promote ease-of-living while creating global value in view of urbanism and civilization.
Beşiktaş	Offering sustainable local development in Beşiktaş while providing for the needs of all borough inhabitants with a contemporary municipal approach.	Smartly fostering Beşiktaş's cultural, natural, historical and economic values while remaining on the cutting-edge regarding all, being Turkey's ascendant value and creating a marque city.
Beyoğlu	The Beyoğlu Municipality advocates that neighborhoods in Beyoğlu are the basic foundation of the city and constructs civic functions, social services, cultural activities and service venues accordingly. By responding to the social needs of each and every resident right at their neighborhood, it improves quality of life across the borough and preserves Beyoğlu's cultural heritage through active use.	Accepting each neighborhood in Beyoğlu as a basic underpinning of the city and building civic services on this foundation; providing urban renewal, social services, cultural activities and the resultant infrastructural and social investments, undertaking necessary arrangements and organizations; strengthening Beyoğlu's leading role in the culture, arts, and tourism industries by facilitating national and international activities; preserving Beyoğlu's cultural and historical heritage through active use; improving the city and quality of life of all residents through the use of information technologies, innovative applications, and participatory democracy.

Fatih	Using resources smartly and efficiently while keeping strong ties with stakeholders in order to invest in people, the city, and information. Preventing internal migration by constantly improving the quality of services offered to inhabitants and transforming the borough of Fatih into a continually habitable city by making it socially, environmentally and economically sustainable; adopting transparent, accountable, participatory, lawful, active, equal and strategically visionary principles of governance in all units of the municipality, and providing service with high performance civil servants, thus offering perfected local governance for people, the community, history and culture, tourism, the economy and other such key areas.	A continually habitable Fatih Borough with its culture, people, and built environment.

Kadıköy	Being a local authority offering sustainable civic services within its scope of responsibility, in order to offer a robust community and environment for all individuals, particularly children and the young, through a participatory, innovative, gracious, equal, and libertarian approach	Being a municipality at the cutting-edge through a participatory approach to governance.
Şişli	Being accessible to all inhabitants of Şişli, particularly disadvantaged individuals and communities and those in need, generating and implementing realistic and sustainable policies and projects in order to improve their quality of life.	Being a local authority that has adopted contemporary and socially minded principles of participatory governance that is problem-solving, effective, competent and perfectionist, with gracious staff, and citizens who are mindful of their city and of concepts of active civic involvement, and are happy and proud of being part of the community.
Üsküdar	Improving the economic and social welfare of all residents of the historically and culturally significant borough of Üsküdar by offering quality, transparent, efficient and effective municipal services with a participatory approach.	Making the historically and culturally significant borough of Üsküdar a center of attraction and a leader in local governance.

ANNEX | 2 | A | 2 | STRATEGIC GOALS, INDICATORS, AND
DIRECTORATES REGARDING CULTURE

This section aims to provide examples
of strategic goals set by local authorities
regarding the city-culture relationship, relevant
indicators, and responsible directorates.
Accordingly, only some strategic goals and a
selection of indicators covering the range of
quantitative and qualitative are provided as
examples, and not all content from the various
strategic plans are included.

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM)	Steering social, economic and physical development in order to contribute to the creation of a livable city while respecting natural history and cultural heritage.	Directorate of City Planning, Directorate of Bosporus Reconstruction, Directorate of Geographic Information Systems, Directorate of Reconstruction, Department of Municipal Police, Directorate of Urban Design, Directorate of Green Areas and Complex Construction, Directorate of Construction Affairs, Directorate of City Planning Workshop, Directorate of Urban Transformation	**Number of** completed **projects; number of non-registered buildings** and immovable cultural assets for which surveying, restitution, restoration and engineering projects are prepared; **number of inspections** run by the Directorate for the Inspection of Conservation Projects (KUDEB) on a regional basis and on a per-building basis; **number of inventoried buildings, number of** Historical Turkish (Janissary) Music **concerts; number of venues** that organize Historical Turkish (Janissary) Music; **number of people** who attend cultural events; event attendance performance **(number of seats filled); number of cultural events** organized; **number of libraries; number of people** who make use of the libraries; **number of museum visitors; level of satisfaction** of museum visitors; **number of books** lent; **number of plays** staged; **level of satisfaction** of theater audiences; **the rate** at which maintenance and repair requests are met (cultural facilities).
	Expanding the reach of practices that promote urban aesthetic		
	Contributing to the protection and advertising of cultural heritage of the city and to the enhancement of cultural life.	European Side Rail Systems, Directorate for the Inspection of Conservation Projects (KUDEB), Directorate of Libraries and Museums, Directorate of Historical Environment Protection, Directorate of Facilities Maintenance and Repair, Directorate of Construction Affairs	
	Ensuring that cultural services are more easily accessible.		

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Beşiktaş	Expanding the reach of cultural, artistic and social events in order to create a different and unique "Beşiktaş brand" where individuals from various cultural backgrounds live together.		**Number of events** organized on national holidays; **number of** contests and **award ceremonies** organized; **level of recognition** of festivals and fairs by the residents of Beşiktaş; **level of satisfaction** with opening ceremonies and concerts; **rate of increase in attendance** to symposiums, talks, conferences, discussions and book-signing events; **number of** completed **cultural and youth centers; the rate** at which demands to be represented in fairs are met.
Beyoğlu	Protecting and improving the historical and cultural heritage of Beyoğlu.	Directorate of Technical Services, Directorate of Survey and Projects, Directorate of Urban Design and Transformation	**Number of historical buildings** to be restored; **rate of completion** of the Sururi Mevlevihane project in Kasımpaşa; restoration project **follow-up rate; number of project sites** designated in existing renovation sites.
	Leading the enhancement of social and cultural life in Beyoğlu.	Directorate of Libraries, Directorate of Survey and Projects, Directorate of Media Affairs, Directorate of Cultural and Social Affairs, Mayor's Office	**Number of plays** to be staged; **number of** cultural and artistic **projects** in production; **number of excursions** to be organized; **number of special days and holidays** on which performances are staged; **number of** cultural event and festival organization **projects.**
	Creating new social facilities and urban facility areas.	Directorate of Technical Services, Directorate of Survey and Projects, Directorate of Libraries, Directorate of Youth and Sports	
	Ensuring the participation of children and youths in social and cultural life.	Directorate of Libraries, Directorate of Youth and Sports	

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Fatih	Working to increase awareness of cultural heritage and assets and contributing to the enhancement of cultural life.	Directorate of Media Affairs, Directorate of Cultural and Social Affairs, Directorate of Public Transportation Services, Directorate of Information Technologies	**Number of projects** carried out; **rate of increase** in tourist satisfaction; **proportional increase** in the number of printed and visual **materials** handed out; **number of excursions** organized; **proportional increase in number of participants; level of increase in satisfaction.**
	Planning and carrying out projects and activities to highlight the touristic potential of the district and to heighten awareness of its cultural richness.		
	Planning and carrying out projects and activities to heighten the awareness of the public and tourists of the history and cultural richness of the district.		
	Carrying out urban transformation, urban design and inspection projects which are harmonious with the history and the cultural and natural heritage of the district and which aim to ensure socio-economic and physical development and to improve the existing living conditions of individuals who have been affected by migration.	Mayor's Office, Directorate of Reconstruction, Directorate of Real Estate and Expropriation, Directorate of Survey and Projects, Directorate of Technical Works, Directorate of Parks and Gardens, Directorate of Building Inspection	**Number of** reconstruction works; **increase in** level of satisfaction; **number of activities** carried out; **number of cases of cooperation** with stakeholders; **increase in satisfaction** for external stakeholders; **number of projects** accepted by the Council; **analysis studies** regarding vested rights; **area of** improved sites; **number of** inspections carried out; **change in number of** complaints received.

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Kadıköy	To provide lasting solutions to infrastructural problems and designing a built environment that both preserves and revitalizes the historic and cultural fabric of the area, all the while adhering to the principle of a 'livable', 'healthy', 'accessible', and 'sustainable' Kadıköy..	Planning and Projects Directorate, Housing and Urban Development Directorate, Directorate of City Planning, Department of Infrastructure and Construction, Directorate of Construction Control	**Number of municipal buildings** with a green building certificate; **Participation in at least one meeting or contest** held by the League of Historic Cities; **Preparation of surveys and restoration projects** for selected historic buildings, Cooperation with local and overseas universities and NGO's on projects aimed at raising the standard of living in Kadıköy; **Project completion rate** for cultural centers; **Number of funding sources** applied to; Preparation of landscaping and street lighting projects for disused urban spaces and parks; **Length of** completed cycling paths; **Rate of responses to requests** about the passing of historic and cultural heritage to future generations; **Rate of oversight** regarding the quality of architectural plans for urban renewal projects; **Number of events scheduled** at the design workshop; **Number of projects** prepared for coast improvement; **rate of street analysis report completion; Number of living streets projects prepared; Number of street workshop projects** for children, and the **number workshops** attended by young designers at the design workshop.

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Kadıköy	Making Kadıköy a city of culture, tourism and arts by identifying, promoting and sharing natural, historical, cultural, artistic and touristic resources.	Directorate of Public Works and Urbanism, Directorate of Project Studies, Directorate of Culture and Social Issues, Directorate of Media and Public Relations, Department of the Private Secretariat, Directorate of Physical Infrastructure, Directorate of Urban Design	**The preparation and printing of a map** of one area selected due to its historical and cultural value; **Rate of completion** in terms of mechanical, structural and electrical plans for the Kadıköy Academy venue project; Preparation of mechanical, structural and electrical plans, archival work, interior outfitting, personnel selection and orientation for the city archival center; **at least one staging of the street art festival**; rate of completion towards the goal of digitizing historical artifacts regarding Kadıköy; **rate of completion of the goal** to protect old buildings, renovate them, repair them, and warn responsible parties about these issues; **number of workshops held** regarding the design of products and street furniture inspired by Kadıköy; **number of** resultant designs; gathering data from relevant directorates and outside stakeholders regarding the creation of cultural assets for the promotion and presentation of the socio-cultural values of Kadıköy, completion of database; **number of national and international events** that will make cultural events more widespread and effective; **number of cultural and artistic events** held at cultural centers; citizen attendance figures for cultural and artistic events; **number of theatrical productions and attendance** at events staged at parks in pursuit of the goal to organize free-of-charge plays and film screenings in neighborhoods and at parks; **number of events and attendance figures** at events held with the aim to promote civic engagement and sensitivity towards historical and cultural heritage; **number of events and the number of children in attendance at theatrical events** aimed at promoting the engagement of children in cultural and artistic education.

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Şişli	Efforts to preserve the historical fabric our borough and enrich its visual appeal will be undertaken.		**Completion of façade and color projects; rate of implementation** of projects submitted regarding building characteristics; collaboration with universities in projects; **completion of works of art; number of architectural competitions** held; **number of festivals** staged; completion of the Şişli book.
	New socio-cultural, artistic and educational venues will be created.		Creation of a **rehabilitation center** for disadvantaged communities; **building area of cultural centers** under construction; **number of community centers built;** rental of the women's rehabilitation house; **number of meetings** to be held with NGO's.
	Arrangements will be made in Şişli's neighborhoods in order to eradicate visual clutter.		**Number of businesses** inspected; creation of the urban design bureau.
	Educational, social and cultural life offerings are to be improved.		
	Policies will be enacted to encourage the utmost participation and access of citizens in educational, cultural and artistic events.		**Number of projects to be funded; number of students** supported. **Number of built and run study** centers; inauguration of the women's sports center; **number of sports schools** opened; **construction of one science center;** outfitting of said science center; **number of sculptural project contests held.**
	Cultural and artistic events will be made sustainable through enrichment.		**Number of events held** in the social and cultural space; **number of overnight and day-trips organized.**

MUNICIPALITIES	STRATEGIC GOALS	AGENTS / RELEVANT UNITS	INDICATORS
Üsküdar	Providing urban infrastructure and civic services by embracing historical and cultural heritage in order to improve quality of life and create a planned urban environment.		**Number of prominent avenue projects** implemented; **rate of completion** of the Üsküdar Mevlevi Lodge restoration project; **rate of completion** of clergy habitation center.
	Improving cultural, artistic, athletic and touristic activities in order to form a city brand.		**Number of culture and arts events** (films, animated features, stage productions) held for children; **number of cultural publications** distributed; **number of cultural events** (concerts, stage productions, memorial evenings; seminars; discussions etc.) organized; **attendance figures** at cultural events; inauguration of the City Museum.

ANNEX **2** **B** MENTIONS OF CULTURAL PLURALITY, GENDER, ETHNIC PLURALITY AND FREEDOM OF RELIGIOUS BELIEF

Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM)	Increase the accessibility and effectiveness of services aimed at improving the quality of life of disadvantaged communities. Offer cultural, educational and social support services for adults, the young, and children.
Beşiktaş	Organize events on international days drawing attention to the plight of communities living under the threat of discrimination. Publicity support for places of worship in our borough from all religions. Remembering important days for and voicing good holiday wishes for followers of different religions.
Beyoğlu	Ensuring the participation in social life of disadvantaged communities. Organizing youth education programs in order to introduce different cultures to the young.
Fatih	Organize socio-cultural activities and provide easy access to them in order to improve individual and societal welfare and increase civic consciousness (Ramadan activities, women's empowerment). Create projects and programs targeting disadvantaged communities and support access to them.
Kadıköy	Ensure gender equality and create all necessary circumstances for the equal, free and secure existence of LGBTI individuals in Kadıköy.
Şişli	Measures will be taken in order to facilitate the participation in social life of persons discriminated against due to their ethnic, religious, and/or gender identity. Improvements will be made in areas they have difficulty in accessing, social integration will be promoted, and discrimination of any kind will battled with civic policies.
Üsküdar	To devise and implement social services aimed at increasing the welfare of communities that have limited financial, spiritual and physical strength and those in need of support. Support will be provided for women in need of help, their participation in social, cultural and economic life will be improved, affirmative action will be applied. With the aim of increasing human rights sensitivity [...] social integration will be achieved by increasing awareness, and feelings of belonging to the borough and nation will be strengthened.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books and Articles

Aksoy, A. & Enlil, Z. (2011). *Kültür Ekonomisi Envanteri* İstanbul 2010. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi University Publishing.

Aksoy, A. & Kutlu, Ü. Z. (2011). Kültürel Haklar, Kültürel Çeşitlilik ve Katılımcı Kültür Politikaları. Serhan Ada (Ed.). in *Sivil Toplum Gözüyle Türkiye Kültür Politikaları Raporu* (p. 105-112). Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi University Publishing.

Belfiore, E. & Bennett, O. (2010). Beyond the Toolkit Approach, Arts Impact Evaluation Reseach and the Realities of Cultural Policy-Making. *Journal for Cultural Research.* 14:2, 121-142.

Blomkamp, E. (2011). Comparing the Uncertain Terrain of Local Cultural Governance in Australia and New Zealand. *Australian Political Science Association Conference.* Canberra, Date accessed: January 8, 2016. http://www.academia. edu/934681/Comparing_the_ Uncertain_Terrain_of_Local_ Cultural_Governance_in_ Australia_and_New_Zealand

Canada Cultural Development Network (2010). Arts Indicators for Local Government: Valuing, Planning for and Measuring the Contribution of the Arts in Local Government in Australia. Date accessed: June 15, 2015. http://www. culturaldevelopment. net.au/downloads/ ArtsIndicators-PartB1.pdf

Dervişoğlu Okandan, G. (2016). The Effect of Cultural and Creative Industries on Economic Development of the Cities: A Comparative Analysis of Turkey and UAE. *Comparative Political and Economic Perspectives on the MENA Region.* IGI Global. p.320-340.

Dinçer, İ. & Enlil, Z. & Ünsal, D. (2011). Tarihi ve Kültürel Miras. Serhan Ada (Ed.) in *Sivil Toplum Gözüyle Türkiye Kültür Politikası Raporu* (p.75-84). Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi University Publishing.

Dunphy, K. et al. (2013). Cultural Planning Practices in Local Government in Victoria, Proceedings of the 3rd National Local Government Researchers' Forum. Adelaide, South Australia.

Dunphy, K. (2010). How Can the Impact of Cultural Development Work in Local Government Be Measured: Towards More Effective Planning and Evaluation Strategies. *Local Global: Identity, Security, Community.* 7, p.100-119. Date accessed: June 18, 2015. http://dro.deakin.edu.au/view/ DU:30045459.

Erdönmez, E. & Akı, A. (2005). Açık Kamusal Kent Mekanlarının Toplum İlişkilerindeki Etkileri. *YTÜ Mimarlık Fakültesi e-Dergisi.* 1:1. p.67-87.

Ertürk, E. (2011). *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı: Adımlar, Araçlar ve Örnekler.* Istanbul: Istanbul Bilgi University Publishing.

Evans, G. (2001). *Cultural Planning: An Urban Renaissance?* New York: Routledge.

Everitt, A. (1999). *The Governance of Culture: Approaches to Integrated Cultural Planning and Policies. Cultural Policies Research and Development Unit.* Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing.

Gabe T., Florida R., Mellander C. (2013). The Creative Class and the Crisis. *Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy, and Society.* 6, p.37-53

Hawkes, J. (2001). *The Fourth Pillar of Sustainability: Culture's Essential Role in Public Planning.* The Cultural Development Network. Melbourne: Common Ground Publishing.

İnce, A. (2009). Yerel Düzlemdeki Kamu İdareleri ve Kültür Politikaları. Serhan Ada / Ayça İnce (Eds.) in *Türkiye'de Kültür Politikalarına Giriş* (p.219-245). Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi University Publishing.

Jackson, R. M. et al. (2006). *Cultural Vitality in Communities Interpretation and Indicators.* Urban Institute Culture, Creativity and Communities Program. Date accessed: June 18, 2015. http://www.urban.org/research/ publication/cultural-vitality-communities-interpretation-and-indicators

Kutlu_Tonak, Z. (2016). Participation and the Right to the City: The Case of Turkey. *ODTÜ Gelişme Dergisi.* January. p.457-480.

Markusen, A. & Gadwa, A. (2010) Arts and Culture in Urban or Regional Planning: A Review and Research Agenda. *Journal of Planning Education and Research.* 29(3). p.379-391.

Mercer, C. (2006). *Cultural Planning for Urban Development and Creative Cities.* Date accessed: June 20, 2015. http://www.kulturplan-oresund. dk/pdf/Shanghai_cultural_ planning_paper.pdf.

Reports

United Nations Industrial Development Organization. Women in Creative Industries. *UnidoGender.* 4. Date accessed: January 21, 2016. http://www.unido.org/ fileadmin/user_media_ upgrade/What_we_do/ Topics/Women_and_Youth/ UNIDO_Gender_Newsletter_ NO.4_A4.pdf

Council of Europe (CoE). Intercultural Cities: Towards a Model for Intercultural Integration. https://book.coe.int/eur/en/cultural-policies/4401-pdf-intercultural-cities-towards-a-model-for-intercultural-integration.html

CoE, Presentation of the Cultural Policy Review of Turkey. http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Reviews/CDCPP-Bu-2013-2_Turkeyexperts_en.pdf

CoE, The Intercultural City Step by Step. https://book.coe.int/usd/en/cultural-policies/5051-the-intercultural-city-step-by-step-practical-guide-for-applying-the-urban-model-of-intercultural-integration.html

Creative City Network of Canada, Cultural Mapping Toolkit. http://www.creativecity.ca/database/files/library/cultural_mapping_toolkit.pdf

Creative City Network of Canada, Cultural Planning Toolkit. http://www.creativecity.ca/database/files/library/cultural_planning_toolkit.pdf

Cultural Policy in Turkey: National Report. http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/Reviews/CDCPP-Bu-2013-19-Turkeynational_en.pdf

World Cities Culture Forum 2012 Report Summary Translation. http://www.worldcitiescultureforum.com/assets/others/D%C3%BCnya_%C5%9Eehirleri_K%C3%BClt%C3%BCr%C3%BC_Raporu_-_%C3%96zet_%C3%87eviri.pdf

IFACCA (2006). Statistical Indicators for Arts Policy. http://media.ifacca.org/files/statisticalindicatorsforartspolicy.pdf

İzmir Development Agency (2013). İzmir 2012 Cultural Infrastructure and Cultural Economy Inventory and İzmir Cultural Economy Development Strategy. http://www.izka.org.tr/files/planlama/2_bolge_plani_dokumanlari/2014-2023/izmir_kultur_stratejisi.pdf

New South Wales Ministry for the Arts, Cultural Planning Guidelines for Local Government. http://lisadavidmegan.wikispaces.com/file/view/Cultural+Planning+Guidelines+for+Local+Government.pdf

Recognizing the Role of Culture to Strengthen the UN Post-2015 Development Agenda. http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/hq/topics/libraries-development/documents/culture_sdgs_-_targets_indicators_201502_-_def.pdf

UCLG Committee on Culture Agenda 21 for Culture. http://www.agenda21culture.net/index.php/documents/agenda-21-forcultureUCLG

Culture 21: Actions. http://www.agenda21culture.net/images/a21c/nueva-A21C/C21A/C21_015_en.pdf

UCLG Culture Summit: Culture and Sustainable Cities. http://www.uclg.org/sites/default/files/cumbre_bilbao_eng_af.pdf

UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity. http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.phpURL_ID=13179&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG), Culture: Fourth Pillar of Sustainable Development. http://www.agenda21culture.net/index.php/docman/-1/393-zzculture4pillarsden/file

World Cities Culture Report 2015. http://www.

worldcitiescultureforum.com/news/world-citiesculture-report-2015-nowpublished

Yaratıcı Endüstriler Konseyi Derneği (YEKON) (2014). İstanbul Yaratıcı Ekonomi Çalışmaları Atölyesi Final Raporu. Istanbul Bilgi University Cultural Policy and Management Research Centre (KPY).

Cultural Plans of International Municipalities

Barcelona Strategic Plan for Culture. http://www.bcn.cat/plaestrategicdecultura/english/index.html

Chicago Cultural Plan. http://www.cityofchicago.org/content/dam/city/depts/dca/Cultural%20Plan/ChicagoCulturalPlan2012.pdf

Columbus Arts District Strategic Plan. http://www.columbus.in.gov/redevelopment/columbus-arts-districtstrategic-plan1

Florida Strategic Plan for Culture. http://dos.myflorida.com/cultural/about-us/strategic-plan

Cultural Strategy for Islington. http://www.islington.gov.uk/publicrecords/library/Leisure-and-culture/Businessplanning/Policies/2011-2012/(2012-03-03)-Cultural-Matters-(1).pdf

London Cultural Strategy 2012-17. http://democracy.cityoflondon.gov.uk/documents/s5956

San Francisco Arts Commission Strategic Plan. http://www.sfartscommission.org/strategicplan-2

Tokyo Vision for Arts and Culture. http://www.seikatubunka.metro.tokyo.jp/en/vision.html

St. Petersburg (FL) Cultural Plan.

http://www.stpete.org/
arts_and_culture/community_
cultural_plan.php

Sugarland Cultural Plan.
http://www.sugarlandtx.gov/
DocumentCenter/View/1572

Sydney Cultural Policy and
Action Plan 2014-2024.
http://www.cityofsydney.
nsw.gov.au/__data/assets/
pdf_file/0011/213986/
Cultural-Policy-and-Action-
Plan-2014-2024.pdf

Waterloo Cultural Plan. http://
www.waterloo.ca/en/living/
cultureplanning.asp

**2015 - 2019 Strategic Plans of
Municipalities in Istanbul**

Istanbul Metropolitan
Municipality (IMM).
http://www.ibb.gov.tr/
tr-TR/kurumsal/Birimler/
StratejikPlanlamaMd/
Documents/2010_2014/
stratejikplan15_19.pdf

Beşiktaş.
http://www.besiktas.bel.
tr/Resimler/file/Strateji-
Kitab%C4%B1Web1.pdf

Beyoğlu.
http://www.beyoglu.bel.tr/
download/stratejik_plan_2015-
2019.pdf

Fatih.
http://www.fatih.bel.
tr/assets/photo2014/
document/2015_2019_stratejik_
plan.pdf

Kadıköy.
http://www.fatih.bel.
tr/assets/photo2014/
document/2015_2019_stratejik_
plan.pdf

Şişli.
https://www.sisli.bel.tr/
FileContent/Document/
stratejik-plan/SP2015-
201904.11.2014.pdf

Üsküdar.
https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/
userfiles/files/2015-2019%20
Stratejik%20Plan.pdf

Legal Regulations

Municipalities Law. http://
www.mevzuat.gov.tr/
MevzuatMetin/1.5.5393.pdf

United Nations International
Covenant on Economic,
Social and Cultural Rights.
http://www.ohchr.org/EN/
ProfessionalInterest/Pages/
CESCR.aspx

Public Financial Management
and Control Law.
http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/
Metin1.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.
5018&MevzuatIliski=0&source
XmlSearch&Tur=1&Tertip=5&
No=5018

By-law on Procedures and
Principles Regarding Strategic
Planning at Public Directorates.
http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/
html/26179_0.html

Law on the Protection of
Cultural and Natural Resources.
https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/
kanunlar/k5226.html

UNESCO Convention on
the Diversity of Cultural
Expressions.
http://portal.unesco.org/en/
ev.php-URL_ID=31038&URL_
DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_
SECTION=201.html

The Convention on the
Protection and Promotion
of the Diversity of Cultural
Expressions.
http://en.unesco.org/
creativity/sites/creativity/files/
convention2005_basictext_
en.pdf

Law on the Renovation and
Preservation Through Use of
Worn Historical and Cultural
Sites.
http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/
MevzuatMetin/1.5.5366.pdf

ISTANBUL FOUNDATION FOR CULTURE AND ARTS (İKSV)

Istanbul Foundation for Culture and Arts (İKSV) is a non-profit cultural institution. Since 1973, the Foundation continues its efforts to enrich Istanbul's cultural and artistic life. İKSV regularly organises the Istanbul Festivals of Music, Film, Theatre and Jazz, the Istanbul Biennial, the Istanbul Design Biennial, Leyla Gencer Voice Competition, autumn film week Filmekimi and realises one-off events throughout the year. The Foundation hosts cultural and artistic events from various disciplines at its performance venue Salon, located at the Nejat Eczacıbaşı Building. İKSV also organises the Pavilion of Turkey at the International Art and Architecture Exhibitions of la Biennale di Venezia and coordinates an artist residency programme at Cité International des Arts, France. Furthermore, İKSV conducts studies and drafts reports with the aim of contributing to cultural policy development. The Foundation also supports artistic and cultural production through presenting awards at its festivals, commissioning works and taking part in international and local co-productions, as well as the Aydın Gün Encouragement Award, presented annually to a young musician working in the field of classical music, and Talât Sait Halman Translation Award, presented to the translator of an outstanding literary translation into Turkish.

www.iksv.org

İSTANBUL'DA

KAMUSAL
ALANDA

SANAT
UYGULAMALARI

İÇİN
ÖNERİLER

TEMMUZ 2011

İKSV

Art in Public Space,
July 2011

İSTANBUL
KÜLTÜR SANAT
VAKFI

EKONOMİK
ETKİ

ARAŞTIRMASI

ARALIK 2012

İKSV

İKSV Economic
Impact Research,
December 2012

ULUSLARARASI

GÜNCEL
SANAT

BİENALLERİNİN

FİNANSMANI

ŞUBAT 2013

İKSV

The Financing of
International
Contemporary
Art Biennials,
February 2013

TÜRKİYE'DE

SANAT
EĞİTİMİNİ

(YENİDEN)

DÜŞÜNMEK

ARALIK 2014

İKSV

(Re)thinking
Arts Education
in Turkey,
December 2014